

# POSITION PAPER ON GENDER AND POVERTY IN SOUTH AFRICA FOR SUBMISSION TO THE NATIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION

**Prepared by Liepollo Lebohang Pheko** 

October 2011

# I. Table of Contents

l	TABLE OF CONTENTS	1
II	GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS & TERMS	
III	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
IV	GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT: AN OVERVIEW OF GLOBAL APPROACHES	5
٧	THE FEMINISATION OF POVERTY	7
VI	FINANCING GENDER EQUALITY	10
VII	POVERTY AND GENDER INEQUALITY	
VIII	GENDER AND EMPLOYMENT	21
IX	EXTERNAL IMPEDIMENTS AND INTERNAL WEAKNESSES OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING25	
X	THE WAY FORWARD: FUTURE PROSPECTS FOR THE GENDER MAINSTREAMING S	STRATEGY29
ΧI	MACROECONOMIC POLICIES AND GENDER EQUALITY	33
XII	SOUTH AFRICA IN THE GLOBAL ECONOMY	34
XIII	MARKET PARTICIPATION AND GENDER EQUALITY	36
XIV	ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT	38
XV	GENDER AND INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,40
XVI	ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT	
XVII	EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT AND EDUCATION	43
XVIII	HOLISTIC DIMENSIONS AND INTERVENTIONS OF POVERTY ERADICATION	45
XIX	MEASURING UNPAID WORK WITHIN A MACRO ECONOMIC FRAMEWORK	49
XX	FEED-BACK FROM THE SAWID PROVINCIAL ROUNDTABLES	52
XXI	RECOMMENDATIONS	57
XXII	CONCLUSION	60
XXIII	REFERENCES	62

# II. GLOSSARY OF ABBREVIATIONS & TERM

AfT Aid for Trade

**AoA** Agreement on Agriculture

**BPFA** Beijing Platform of Action

**CEDAW** Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

**ECA** Economic Commission for Africa

**ECD** Early Childhood Development

**GATS** General Agreement Trade in Services

**GDI** Gender Related Development index

**GEI** Social Watch's Gender Equity Index

**GDP** Gross Domestic Product

**GEM** Gender Empowerment Measure

**GEAR** Growth Employment and Redistribution

**GMOs** Genetically Modified Organisms

**GRB** Gender Responsive Budgeting

ICT Information and Communication Technology

IFI International Financial Institution

IMF International Monetary Fund

MDGs Millennium Development Goals

NPC National Planning Commission

**NSAHP** National Satellite Accounts of Household Production

NTA National Time Accounts

SADC Southern African Development Community

**SAWID** South African Women in Dialogue

**SMME** Small Medium and Micro Enterprise

TRCB Trade Related Capacity Building

TRIPS Trade Related Intellectual Property Rights

**TNC** Trans-National Corporation

**UNDP** United Nations Development Programme

WID Women in Development

**WB** World Bank

WTO World Trade Organisation

# **Gender and Poverty in South Africa Today**

# III. Executive Summary

Poverty in South Africa is considered to have increased for the majority of people in the present era of structural adjustment programmes. In terms of absolute numbers, poor people constitute 61% of the population, while the absolute poor, or indigent, constitute 30%. It is also asserted that women are the poorest of the poor, what has been termed the "feminisation of poverty", thereby highlighting the significance of the gender dimension of poverty.

However, poverty is a relative term; the indicators of which cannot be universalised. It is not merely an issue about income and low purchasing power, but rather encompasses ideological and political implications which are partly determined by people's perceptions. Thus, beyond this generalisation, there are various dimensions of poverty in terms of geography, urban/rural groups, and vulnerable groups and minorities.

Ever since Ester Boserup wrote the ground-breaking book, "Women's Role in Economic Development" in 1970, the question of women, particularly in relation to issues of poverty alleviation and eradication, has assumed greater significance. As a conceptual point of reference, it is useful to describe the distinction between "gender" and "women" and the relationship between the two. While women connote a biological category constituted by the female sex, gender refers to the social and historical constructions of maleness and femaleness. Gender is a broad concept that helps in looking at the concrete manifestations of disparities between men and women and to historise it further. Thus, it is possible to capture the different lived experiences of different men and women, taking into account divisions such as class, race, religion, and nationality. This paper will attempt to give a critical view of the place of women in the poverty debate at the levels of theory and practice. It gives an overview of some of the realities of gender and poverty in South Africa, and concludes with some comments on the need for a substantial and holistic empowerment for women.

# IV. Gender and Development: An Overview of Global Approaches

When discussing poverty, the thread within the broad discourse is that of human development, which refers to the overall improvement in the quality of life of the people. In the process of achieving development, however, there arise differentials, one of which is that between men and women. It is recognised that men and women play different roles, have different needs, and face different constraints arising from fundamental imbalances in their respective rights and obligations. Hence, they have differential standing in terms of access to resources which results in women becoming an economically deprived group.

The first approach in the development debate was the welfare approach that dates back to colonial times, when church organisations took care of the poor and needy women and organised mothers' clubs. Basically, this approach conceptualises women, first and foremost, as mothers responsible for their children and family.

It understands women to be objects of development and at best makes some improvement in the household welfare without, however, changing the existing forms of resource allocation and distribution. It is argued that the welfare approach became popular because the policies and programmes that derived from it carried no redistributional consequences for men. This perhaps can also explain its acceptability, even today, in terms of multilateral aid.

#### **Development of the Welfare Model**

From women's circles, particularly in the United States, came the view that beyond welfare, there was a need to address the relative status of women to address questions of equity. The approach emphasised the fact that women had been left behind in the process of development and that there was a need to ensure equal access for men and women. This approach necessitated a strategy of integration, of ensuring that women were beneficiaries of development just as men were. This approach, however, began with a view of development as a monolithic process and was particularly flawed on questions of gender in development processes.

Women, particularly in African countries, cannot be said to have been "outside" development; they were already integrated in terms of the cash economy, migrant labour and other processes. Thus, the

question should not only be that of integration, but regarding the very nature of development which creates and reinforces inequalities between men and women.

Soon, the equity approach was eclipsed by the anti-poverty approach, which focused on poor women. The view here is that economic growth does not necessarily trickle down to the poor, especially women, and women's problems are related more to poverty rather than to subordination. In terms of institutionalization, this approach bred what is referred to as income-generating projects for women, productive activities for poor women to supplement their income. The underlying assumption of income-generating projects is that women's labour time is assumed to be infinitely elastic while conversely harbouring notions of negative valuation of the responsibilities for daily subsistence that women already engage in, the so-called "unpaid work of women", thereby compounding the burden of work that women are supposed to carry.

#### The 1980s Development Meltdown

Due to the economic crises in the 1980s, there came a shift in the development discourse, and efficiency came to be emphasised as a key concept. In relation to women, the efficiency approach highlights the fact that development can no longer afford to ignore women. The Ugandan President is often quoted as saying that involving women is not only a question of social justice but also (and perhaps most importantly), a question of good economics. Implied in this stance is that women are the newly-discovered instruments to be in pursuance of in the development process. This instrumentalism or conceptualization of women as instruments or objects to be used, tends to permeate initiatives such as those on the environment, family planning, population control, and child health. In the particular case of population control as one of the ways of addressing development problems, women's bodies are specifically targeted as the instruments through which specified goals can be achieved; this gives much less concern to women as human beings and citizens.

All these approaches have one major aspect in common: they ignore the question of power. The empowerment approach was developed to correct this oversight. Empowerment was strongly articulated by feminists of the third world who argued that most of the approaches from the West ignored differing power relations between men and women, between classes and regions, and, above all, ignore the power relations between nations.

Empowerment was therefore defined as freedom from oppression, the power for women to control their own lives, both within and outside their homes, and the removal of all forms of inequity through

the creation of a more just social and economic order, both nationally and internationally. Empowerment as a concept, therefore, embodies a holistic approach to addressing problems of social inequality.

# V. The Feminisation of Poverty

The term 'feminisation of poverty' refers to an increase in the relative levels of poverty among women and/or female headed households. It deserves special attention from policy makers since it is related to two negative phenomena: gender inequality and poverty. Given that the increase of poverty among a social group tends to set priorities for public policies, in the last decade the discourse on feminisation has had some impact on the agenda to promote gender equality in the economic sphere.

This, however, comes at the risk of collapsing the broader gender inequality concerns into a pure poverty agenda. Based on the available evidence about Latin America and some developed countries, this paper briefly reviews whether there really is a generalised feminisation of income poverty. More importantly, his paper argues that poverty—as currently measured—captures only a small part of the important gender inequalities in the economic sphere.

Much has been said about a feminisation of poverty globally. But such a feminisation should not be confused with higher levels of poverty among women or female-headed households. The term 'feminisation' relates to the way poverty changes over time, whereas 'higher levels of poverty' refers to the levels of poverty at a given moment; and it includes the so-called overrepresentation of women among the poor. Thus, "feminisation" is a process; while 'higher poverty" is a state.

#### **Definitions Challenged**

The question then raised is whether there is a generalised feminisation of poverty across the world, and this supposition remains unanswered. There are not many empirical studies about this subject and, of course, a conclusive answer to this question depends on a comprehensive analysis based on data including several regions of the world. Yet the existing information about the Americas and Western Europe points in the direction of a negative answer. The first study identifying a feminisation of income poverty was about the USA, covering a period from the 1950s to the 1970s. Other studies followed, some of them arguing that such a feminisation did not happen in the USA in the 1960s, '70s and '80s. Likewise, studies of the United Kingdom found no evidence of a relative increase in the poverty among women or female-headed households between the 1970s and 1980s. In Canada, a worsening of the

gender gap in poverty indicators was found for the period 1973-1990 if one compares female-headed with male-headed households, but not if the focus turns to an overall women-men comparison.

Various studies found no evidence of a feminisation of income poverty in the 1990s in the countries that together encompass the large majority of the population of Latin America. This result holds for different definitions of feminisation of poverty and for various poverty lines and assumptions about intrahousehold inequality. Out of eight countries, including all the most populous ones, only in two—post-crisis Argentina and Mexico—a relative worsening of poverty indicators for female-headed households was found, but even in these countries no relevant differences were identified in overall women-men comparisons.

#### **Poverty and Female -Headed Households**

Several studies found that the overrepresentation of women or female-headed households among the poor (a state) is a much more common phenomenon than the "feminisation" of poverty (a process). Although higher levels of income poverty among these groups occur in many countries, however, this is not a general rule. Even in developing countries there is no rigid connection between the sex of the head of the household and poverty. In fact, poverty seems to be more correlated with the presence of children in the family and other characteristics of the household members.

A review of studies about developed and transitional economies shows that there was a high degree of over-representation of female headed households in poverty in Canada, Australia, Russia, USA and Germany in the 1990s; and a higher incidence of poverty among women was identified in the 1980s in the USA, Australia, Germany, Canada and UK, but not in Spain.

#### **Studies of Various Developing Countries**

In developing countries, studies indicate that female-headed households are more likely to be in poverty in Brazil and in urban India but not in six Sub- Saharan African countries, three Asian countries and thirteen other Latin American countries. One review comparing sixty-one [61] country studies found that in thirty—eight [38] of them there was an overrepresentation of female-headed households among the poor, and in fifteen of them some kind of relationship between certain types of female headship and poverty. However, in eight of these countries it did not find any such links. The conclusion of another review, based on more than one hundred country studies, is that only in certain countries do the female-headed households consistently present worse poverty indicators.

Most studies are based on surveys of income or consumption at the household level. Invariably they neglect any inequalities in the distribution of income within the households. However, from a gender perspective, such an implicit assumption of perfect distribution can be disputed. There is no reason to believe that the factors that determine gender inequalities in the public sphere will not act within families or households.

#### **Resource Allocation**

On the contrary, despite the scarcity of data to support such research, the very few studies available about this subject present some evidence of significant intra-household inequalities. They identified differences in the final allocation of economic resources among family members, usually favouring men. If intra-household inequalities were taken into consideration, we would probably find that the current figures of the levels of income or consumption poverty among women are underestimated.

Everything indicates that the real levels of poverty among women are higher than the ones commonly presented. These data for developing countries, however, are so limited that one will hardly be able to correctly estimate how much higher these levels are. The inclusion of intra-household inequalities in the analysis of the feminisation of poverty seems to be an unlikely scenario for the near future, as this would require the measurement of these inequalities at more than one point in time. But, differently from the issue of overrepresentation, such an inclusion would not necessarily show that the feminisation is underestimated.

What matters for the notion of the feminisation of poverty is not the level of intra-household inequality, but an increase in the bias against women. As the situation of women in many developing countries has improved in the last decades, relative to that of men, the result of this inclusion would probably be in the opposite direction, that is, of a reduction of the feminisation of poverty if intra-household inequalities were considered.

This illustrates an important issue, both from the theoretical and practical points of view: **poverty as usually measured should not be our priority guide to gender equity actions.** Although we frequently conceive poverty at the individual level, our measurement in effect occurs at the household level. The practice among researchers is usually to measure total family income or consumption, or the satisfaction of basic needs by households, and then to divide it by the number of persons in these households to come up with per capita estimates. Thus, the unit of analysis of poverty is the family or household.

# VI. Financing Gender Equality

Financing gender equality in the context of development and democracy requires specific and focused attention to allocating budgetary resources for the education, health care, training, skills and entrepreneurial development that are necessary to improve the lives of girls and women and to promote the overall economic empowerment of women. In order for this to occur in a predictable and sustainable manner, there must be strategic rethinking of frameworks of fiscal policy, public finance, debt sustainability, monetary policy, exchange rate management, financial market regulations, trade reform and the negotiations of trade agreements.

Increasingly, these areas are no longer the sole preserve of domestic policy makers, but are becoming interlinked within the operations of the broader multilateral trading system, global finance and global macroeconomic arrangements through formal processes of coherence between trade and financial institutions such as the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank and the World Trade Organisation. This is also true of the harmonization of aid under the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness.

Gender equality is critical for ensuring women's enjoyment of their human rights and is also critical for sustained and equitable economic development. Thus gender equality was identified as a central pillar of the eight millennium development goals (MDGs). Goal 3 of the MDGs operationalises gender equality in terms of the elimination of gender disparity in (primary and secondary) education. The Millennium Project Task Force on Goal 3 further expanded gender equality to encompass at least 5 other goals:

- equal opportunity
- equal ownership and control over productive assets,
- freedom from drudgery,
- equal representation in decision-making and freedom, and
- freedom from the threat of violence.

These six dimensions of gender equality can be aggregated in terms of the three inter-related and interdependent operational domains of: Capabilities, Resources & Opportunity and Security Domains (Grown et al 2006).

The Capabilities Domain include all of the elements that are important and necessary for enabling basic human ability and which are hence fundamental to the wellbeing of women and girls—for example, education, health and nutrition. The Access to Resources and Opportunities Domain includes all those

elements necessary for the application of the basic abilities to mature and ripen, thus enabling girls and women to contribute maximally to social and economic life. This domain refers to a) equal opportunity to economic assets such as land, property, infrastructure and income and b) equal opportunity to political participation.

The Security Domain includes all the factors that will help to reduce women's and girls vulnerability to violence and conflict. The elements in these three domains are operationalised through seven strategic priorities revolving around:

- provision of universal primary education and post primary education for girls;
- guaranteeing sexual and reproductive health and rights;
- reducing women's and girls' time burdens;
- guaranteeing women's and girls' property and inheritance rights;
- eliminating inequality in employment, gender gaps in earnings and occupational segregation;
- increasing women's share of seats in national parliaments and local government bodies and;
- reducing violence against girls and women (UN Millennium Project 2005).

Operationalisation of the seven strategic priorities to achieve gender equality will require financial, human and infrastructural resources. They will also require proactive interventions, on the part of governments, in terms of legislation, policies and institutional changes. Both aspects of this require that gender equality interventions; both targeted (directed at reducing gender equality) and non-targeted (directed at social development which has positive external effects on improving the life and living conditions of girls and women) are integrated as priorities areas into the national budgetary decision making process. They must also be ingrained in macroeconomic frameworks that determine fiscal, monetary and trade policies.

#### **Capabilities Domain: Food Security, Health Care And Education**

Only to the extent that WTO provisions result in outcomes that increase the nutritional and food status of girls and women, enabling them to have access to affordable quality health care and education, do these trade agreements have a powerful and positive impact for gender equality. To the extent that agreements such as the Agreement on Agriculture, General Agreement on Trade in Services, the Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property and other trade provisions impact negatively on these factors, they curtail the development of girls and women's capabilities. In this section we begin a preliminary

analysis of these critical interactions between World Trade Organisation provisions and the capabilities domain, focusing on the issues of food security and health care.

The Agreement on Agriculture (AOA) Agricultural liberalisation presents opportunities and challenges for ensuring adequate nutritional support for women and girls and their overall long term health and well being. It is a well-known fact that food is being exported to many poor developing countries at prices well below the cost of producing it. This practice, known as "dumping," jeopardises the livelihoods of small farmers, and may jeopardise food security in poor countries which are now much more dependent on imported food.

#### The Equal Opportunity Domain

Trade expansion is lauded and desirable for its potential to generate employment, increase income and improve the overall welfare in a country. It is therefore important to examine how this plays out in relation to gender equality, specifically with regard to the two aspects (economic assets and participation) of the Equal Opportunity Domain of the gender equality schematic. In terms of economic assets, it is widely acknowledged that trade impacts on factor incomes, especially the factor that is used most dominantly in exports. Since in most Commonwealth countries, women provide the bulk of the labour for traded goods, it might be expected that there will be an increase in women's income. Thus, trade is also expected to alter the distribution of income and by extension property and other resources.

#### A) Economic Assets

Most small farmers in developing countries are finding it difficult to compete with the better-resourced farmers from developed countries (UNCTAD 2004: 78, 107-108). Women, compared to men, are particularly disadvantaged by lack of access to credit, agricultural extension services, tools and ownership of land (Grown, Rao Gupta and Kes 2005; FAO 2002; World Bank 2001b).

# **B) Political Participation**

In terms of the domain of political participation, the trade related aspects of this domain are in terms of 1) women's participation and contribution to trade policy decision making, including the formulation of trade negotiation mandates; 2) gender composition of trade policy ministries and delegations at national, regional and multilateral levels; and 3) The integration of gender expertise at the highest technical and political level of trade making apparatuses.

# The Security Domain

The contribution of trade to women's security is multi-pronged. One aspect is the security (from sexual harassment and rape) in the work place. Another dimension of trade related gender security issues is the trade-off in budgetary items in making choices between the financing of trade institutions versus securing public safety and social development.

#### **Trade Expansion And The Labour Market**

To the extent that trade expansion and intensification generates changes in domestic legislation regarding the operations of the domestic labour market, in terms of opening spaces for women to work at night or travelling longer distance to work or to even dwell away from home in specially operated export processing zones, trade policy introduces an added dimension to women's personal security and insecurity. However, if policy makers devise complementary and offsetting mechanisms that improves the public space for women to operate in, even if this is initially driven by demands emanating from the trade sectors, as long as there are positive spill-over effects that reduce the gendered impacts of violence and conflicts against women, then trade liberalization will contribute to women's personal security.

If these extra-security dimensions around women's employment in the trade sector are left unattended, then trade will further exacerbate the impact of violence against woman. There is also the unsavoury side of the expansion of women's employment in the trade sector, which is that with women as the preferred or desired labour force, poor and unskilled men are left out of the equation or may even become displaced by women workers.

This is especially so for those developing countries that are experiencing systematic and persistent supply side constraints. But more generally these are issues which have dominated in the area of trade related capacity building (TRCB) which tends to focus on micro-level support and institutional interventions. Since TRCB programmes tend to operate at the enterprise and institutional level, it would seem to be one aspect of trade that has great synergy with gender mainstreaming and a wide scope for the integration of gender considerations. However to date this has not been the case. With the exception of CIDA, which has developed a framework for engendering TRCB, there has not been much focused national or regional attention on ensuring the gender equality dimensions of trade development or trade readiness.

Trade-related capacity building that is supportive of gender equality interventions would proactively examine the challenges and constraints that SMEs and other women-owned businesses face with regard to market entry and trade readiness.

#### **Critical Questions To Be Posed Include:**

- What kinds of trade readiness or capacity building programmes and projects are needed for women-owned and-operated businesses versus for male-owned businesses as it relates to particular areas of export supply services, export training, capital upgrading, product upgrade, access to credit, access to export markets (export market requirements) and the building of a product niche?
- · Who are the normal targets of TRCB & technical assistance? To what extent are the needs, priorities and concerns of micro, SME's and women entrepreneurs taken into account in the design, planning and implementation of TRCB projects and programmes?

Many of the key considerations of market access that are problematic for SMEs and smallholders in the agricultural sector such as physical infrastructure—roads, ports, railways and access to ICT, have their own distinct gender dimension which needs to be specifically targeted and addressed within the context of TRCB planning. Women and poor minority businesses operating in the export and import competing sectors have a greater need for accessing many of the softer elements of market access and market entry such as incentives, tricks of the trade with regulations, and assistance with the costs of information & communications as well as dealing with global supply chains and product development. Programmes geared to providing export training, building and maintain trading networks, assisting with capital upgrading, technical standards and regulations, and standards for specific export markets, if tailored with adequate gender sensitivity, can prove highly beneficial to women economic actors.

## **Trade Policy And Regulation**

In their multiple roles as workers, community and household caretakers and business actors, women are greatly impacted by reforms of trade policy and trade regulation arriving from trade-offs, trade disputes and institutional and technical support that aims to facilitate the implementation of trade agreements. Women business owners, who usually are under-capitalised and have less access to finance and credit than their male counterparts, must grapple with the day-to-day reality of complying with rules and standards emanating from changing trade policy and trade regulation. Likewise, women and men

workers in the import competing sectors are also differently impacted by trade rules that liberalize these sectors.

In the area of trade and development, women's businesses are also impacted by investment and trade promotion that determine the flow of project funding and technical assistance. Most often they are the least serviced, if at all. Thus there is a need to tailor programmes and projects focused on investment expansion or deepening to the key critical needs of women-owned micro and Sees. Women may also require highly differentiated business support services that are specifically targeted to meet women's priorities and concerns. Women entrepreneurs who are involved with the export sector or who are contemplating future involvement in this sector may also require particular attention in the area of trade finance, trade promotion, market analysis and development.

#### Aid For Trade, Women And Infrastructure

As has been noted by Elson and Gideon, women may also be differently impacted by the design and development of physical infrastructure such as roads and ports that would be part of the dynamics of any trade-related infrastructure under Aid for Trade [AfT]. The focus on what kinds of infrastructure will receive priority attention and support--whether it is feeder roads or simply main roads are critical to the survival and expansion of women and small farmers in ensuring access to markets and their ability to be independent of middlemen; it may also lessen their dependency on lesser remunerative farm-gate pricing structure.

Overall, gender should be a concern in all aspect of AfT including 'trade related adjustment' and 'other trade related needs', but, especially, those programmes and projects aimed at building the 'supply side capacity' and the 'human resource availability of developing countries' (AfT Task Force Report). The importance of gender in AfT was also flagged in the report of the Aid for Trade Task Force (under section F)x. While the report did undertake a wide or deep discussion on gender issues, these issues must be advocated for as paramount to policies, programmes and policies of poverty eradication, development and gender equality. This is particularly so in a '... discourse on the link between the multilateral trade regime negotiations and Aid for Trade (which) puts Trade at the centre of growth promotion and poverty reduction strategies at the national, regional and multilateral level' (Isodor2006).

Policy discussions about the interactions between poverty and gender inequality have tended, during the last two decades, to use the idea of the *feminisation of poverty* to explain differences between male and female poverty in a given context, as well as changes over time. Typically, this approach has

supported the perception that female-headed households, however defined, tend to be poorer than other households. Some empirical work has, however, cast doubt on this generalisation and resulted in gender and poverty analysts reassessing some previously held presumptions about women's coping and income levels. This however requires clearer delineation.

It is clear now that, not only is the empirical generalisation inaccurate, but that a single-minded focus on female-headed households narrows which households we focus on and how we understand what goes on within them. Focusing on female-headed households is of course much simpler, since this avoids having to address the messy complexities posed by gender relations within households, or the ways in which development policies and programmes affect them. But it is clearly inadequate to the task.

# Is Poverty Only Gendered?

Viewing **poverty** as a **gendered** experience allows us to broaden the scope of analysis to include all poor households, however headed. It also directs us to a wider range of issues beyond simply asking whether women or men are poorer in income terms. These include the ways in which poverty is made a gendered experience by norms and values, divisions of assets, work and responsibility, and relations of power and control. Gendered experiences include:

- (i) the differential impacts of poverty on girls versus boys, and women versus men within the household;
- (ii) the gendered ways in which poor households and their members respond to poverty; and
- (iii) the gendered impact of the design and implementation of anti-poverty policies and programmes. Understanding how gender relations work to define the experience of programmes requires focusing on:
  - · Who receives or has access to resources;
  - How roles and relationships of work, responsibilities, cooperation, sharing or conflict define both women's and men's living and working conditions within households;
  - How structures and programmes of the state and other actors, e.g. the private sector and civil society, reinforce or transform those roles and relationships; and
  - · How normative frameworks affecting differential entitlements and responsibilities are challenged or reinforced by policies and programmes.

.

#### **Experiences Of Care Work**

The generalisation that girls and women bear greater work burdens and responsibility for the care of communities, through their unpaid work within households, is well-grounded empirically through numerous time-use and qualitative studies. The experience of care work, however, varies profoundly between poor versus non-poor, rural versus urban, or landed versus landless households. Evidence from the National Sample Survey in India shows that care work in the poorest rural households is likely to include mainly fuel and water gathering, while in somewhat better-off households, it includes the care of livestock and kitchen gardens, or fodder collection. In households that are slightly better off, women are also more likely to engage in activities such as embroidery and supervision of household workers.

# VII. Poverty and Gender Inequality

The relationship between the incidence of poverty and the level of gender equality as measured by various alternative indices suggests that developing countries with higher gender equality tend to have lower poverty rates. The chart presents a scatter plot of poverty headcount ratio (for the \$2 per day poverty line) and gender equality, as measured by the female-to-male ratio of sex-specific Human Development Indices for a set of 73 countries circa 1997. The inverse relationship between gender equality and poverty shown in this scatter plot is quite robust to other measures of poverty and other measures of gender equality.

Bivariate correlations, of course, cannot establish causality. One could easily argue, for example, that increases in wealth drive increases in gender equality—rather than the other way round—since discrimination may become increasingly costly to firms in developed economies with tighter labour markets.

#### **Linking Poverty And Location**

In fact, cross country correlations and even more rigorous regression analysis are unlikely ever to allow us to establish definitive relationships between gender equality and poverty; the simultaneities are too great and we do not have suitable econometric instruments to solve this problem. It is considerably easier to examine the links between gender equality and poverty at the household level. It is often thought that female-headed households are more likely to be poor than male-headed households. Empirical evidence on this score, however, is mixed

One review of 61 studies on headship and poverty found female-headed households to be disproportionately represented among the poor in only 38 cases; another finds that the relationship between female headship and poverty is strong in only two out of ten countries examined.

One reason for these mixed results is that it is not easy to define headship. Studies apply a variety of techniques including definitions of headship used by national surveys, self-reported headship status by survey respondents, and definitions based on contributions to household income. There is also substantial heterogeneity among female-headed households. Depending on the country and region, the population of female-headed households may be primarily composed of elderly widows, divorced women, single women with children, or women whose husbands are migrants. Some of these groups, such as the elderly and widows, are more vulnerable to falling into poverty than others, such as women who receive remittances from migrant husbands.

#### Female Headed Households Versus Male Headed Households

Why might female-headed households be more likely to be poor than male-headed households? A study from Brazil examines three possible explanations: (1) fewer adults have positive income, (2) the labour income of principal earners is low, and (3) the dependency ratio is high. The study comes to the conclusion that the low labour income of the principal earners is the primary reason why female-headed households in Brazil are poorer.

Simulations show that if the earners in female-headed households had the average incomes of earners in male-headed households, their average per capita expenditure would be higher than that of male-headed households. This is primarily because female-heads are more likely to participate in the labour market relative to male-heads.

Are female-headed households more likely to be chronically poor than male-headed households? That depends on the differences in their respective abilities to adopt and manage risk. Empirical analysis of poverty dynamics shows that household heads' education, household demographics and average wealth are important determinants of chronic poverty. To the extent that female household heads tend to have less education and their households contain a higher proportion of dependents, their households are more likely to be chronically poor than male-headed households.

Ample evidence suggests that greater gender equality in resources such as education and access to employment can reduce the likelihood of a household being poor. Female labour force participation, in particular, has been shown to play a key role in cushioning households from the impact of macroeconomic shocks and keeping households from falling into poverty.

## **Barriers To Women's Market Participation**

At the same time, barriers to female labour force participation remain significant in some countries. Barriers frequently identified include: the time burden associated with child-rearing and other domestic tasks, low educational levels vis-a-vis men in some regions of the developing world that make women less competitive for quality jobs, the role of existing wage male-female wage gaps in generating an 'underinvestment' in female education and lower female labour force participation rates than would be the case in the absence of such wage gaps, and laws and customs that inhibit women's participation in labour markets.

Constraints to women's participation in other markets also matters for poverty reduction. The existing research on credit markets in developing countries— admittedly scarce—suggests that by and large women receive unfavorable treatment not because of discriminatory treatment per se, but rather because of gender differences in individual characteristics that are relevant for loan qualification, e.g. holding land titles.

One institution that has had a major impact on relaxing credit constraints for the poor in general and for poor women in particular has been microcredit. Microcredit programmes, by providing small loans mainly for non-agricultural microenterprise activities, have had a significant positive effect on household incomes and assets, child schooling, child and maternal health, and the empowerment of female borrowers. Consequently, microcredit programmes are found widely around the developing world and are considered to be an important, cost-effective instrument for helping the poor transform their economic circumstances by enabling them to pursue more lucrative livelihood opportunities.

#### **Gender**, **Tenure** And Land Markets

With regard to land markets, data on landholdings disaggregated by sex are woefully lacking in many regions of the world. The scant existing evidence appears to show that the distribution of land ownership is heavily skewed towards men. In Latin America, between 70 and 90 per cent of formal owners of farmland are male and conditional on land ownership, men on average own more farmland than women. Land ownership and tenure are crucial for a number of reasons. Land ownership is often the primary source of transferable and inheritable wealth; it is also frequently a requisite for participating in formal credit markets in rural areas. Careful studies show that tenure insecurity impairs investment incentives in general. Coupled with higher levels of tenure insecurity for women in many settings, this suggests that women's agricultural productivity relative to men's is likely to be lower due to higher tenure insecurity.

Several studies in Sub-Saharan Africa show that women have lower agricultural productivity than men on same-sized plots growing the same crops. Whatever limited land rights women possess may be precisely because men do not work on women's individual plots, and the reallocation of labour and other inputs from men's plots to women's plots may threaten these rights.

There are a host of interesting policy research issues related to gender equality and poverty reduction. For some of these issues, the accumulated body of research is impressive; for others it is scant indeed. Surprisingly, there are many areas of crucial importance to policy—such as gender issues in the functioning of credit and land markets—where quite basic questions remained to be answered. These questions are of central importance to the design of poverty reduction policies and projects.

#### **Dimensions of household poverty**

Inequalities between men and women cannot however be studied having only the household as the unit of analysis, as this approach tends to mask much of the dynamics of the relations between individuals. Even if we narrow the debate of gender equity to the economic sphere, from the perspective of gender relations it matters not only how much a woman can consume, but also how she achieves the power toconsume. Often, poverty research merely calculates the expected consumption per household member—more exactly, a simple or weighted average of the family income or observed consumption

—thus neglecting how the economic power within the household is structured.

Many have taken the feminisation of poverty as a global fact. Of course, the term can be used to express different concepts, but in the sense of a worsening of the situation of women in relation to that of men—or female-headed versus male-headed households—there is no clear evidence of a widespread feminisation of poverty in the world. And while finding higher levels of poverty among women or female-headed households is far more common than finding a gender bias in the evolution of poverty over time, this is not a universal phenomenon either.

Beyond that, we have to question the degree of importance we should give to these issues. There is no doubt that poverty should occupy a prominent position in the political agenda, but the concerns about a feminisation of poverty or the overrepresentation of women among the poor should not overshadow the debate on gender inequality. When we talk about poverty in the way we currently measure it, we are using a concept that captures only a small part of important gender inequalities. It seems that both researchers and policy makers would gain from focusing on related but different issues, such as the lack of economic autonomy of women.

# VIII. Gender And Employment

Fundamental and far-reaching changes have taken place in the world economy over the past several decades that have had a profound impact on the lives of women and men. Two key aspects of the transformation are (i) the heightened and growing degree of global economic, social and cultural integration—i.e. the process of 'globalisation'—and (ii) a shift in policy stance towards deregulated markets, privatisation, a smaller role for the state and a relatively narrow focus on reducing inflation.

These changes impact on employment and poverty outcomes for women and men. Gender dynamics are central to this discussion. Whether households stay out of poverty in this changing global environment may hinge on whether women participate in the labour force and have access to decent paid employment.

#### **Allocation Of Labour And Economic Resources**

Women's measured labour force participation has been increasing in many regions around the world, a process sometimes described as 'the feminisation of labour'. However, these global changes have a fundamental impact on the allocation of labour time and economic resources in the household. Moreover, employment opportunities are unequally distributed, with women concentrated in lower quality, more precarious forms of paid work. Taken together, all these factors have enormous implications for the vulnerability of households, the risk of poverty and achieving sustainable human development. Therefore, the analysis must incorporate a gender perspective when interpreting how global policy changes impact employment and poverty.

Gender relations determine the ways in which market and non-market work is organised. Women often have primary responsibility for unpaid, non-market housework and caring labour. This constrains their choices in terms of labour force participation and their access to paid employment, both formal and informal. The allocation of time to non-market as opposed to market work limits the household income that women control directly. Furthermore, with more time allocated to non-market work, women frequently have less paid work experience or have to interrupt their employment, factors which often translate into lower earnings.

Gender segmentation is endemic in labour markets around the world, with women often concentrated in low-paid, unstable and poor-quality employment. Wage labour markets might not be the only, and often not the most important, market exchange relating to these forms of employment. For instance, quasi labour markets exist in which workers sell a product or service, but within a set of dependent relationships that limit their authority over the employment arrangement. Examples include subcontracted production, or home work, in which workers produce or assemble goods for a set of specification given by the work provider within a longer supply chain.

#### **Social Protection And Benefits**

Often social benefits and protection are absent for these types of precarious and informal employment, raising the economic risk that women working in these activities face, as they are undertaken

outside the ambit of labour legislation. This type of labour force segmentation reduces women's earning potential. With lower expected earnings, investment in female education is frequently neglected.

Similarly, perceived lower earning potential of women reinforces the gender division of labour within the household, since the opportunity cost, in terms of foregone income, of specialising in unpaid care work is lower for women than for men. Women who specialise in providing unpaid care work face enormous economic risks. Such specialisation not only lowers their earnings potential and reinforces dependencies on a male 'breadwinner'. Often women do not have the same access to social protections, such as pensions for old age, thereby increasing their risk of falling into poverty.

The gender division between market and non-market work, the unequal distribution of employment opportunities, and women's lower earnings potential reinforce established gender dynamics at household level. For example, women's influence over the distribution of resources and labour within the household is weakened when opportunities to earn income through employment are limited.

Increasing women's access to paid employment has the potential to change gender roles and household dynamics, depending on the resilience of gender norms in society and the type of employment to which women have access.

#### **Paid Markets And Gender Relations**

The relationship between paid market work and prevailing gender relations is complex. Access to remunerative employment does not always translate into control over a portion of the household's income. Similarly, labour market participation may involve costs as well as benefits. These factors influence the extent to which women's access to employment alters gender dynamics.

Labour supply decisions are often determined at both household and individual levels. Women's labour force participation has been shown to increase with economic crises and policies that trigger labour displacement, job instability and higher rates of unemployment. Women also increase their labour force participation in response to sustained structural unemployment. For instance, research into the determinants of women's labour supply in post-apartheid South Africa has shown that women's labour force participation responded to increases in household joblessness, thereby placing further upward pressure on the country's average unemployment rate.

#### Where Men Are In The Economy

Structural changes that threaten household living standards also demonstrate the impact of established gender norms on men. Not all men occupy identical positions within the global economy. Many men are employed in precarious activities with low earnings. In addition, racial and ethnic identity frequently circumscribes the economic opportunities available to both men and women. Growing earnings inequality, an erosion of the quality of paid work, or greater joblessness disproportionately affects those in more unstable forms of employment. The entire household— men, women and children—becomes susceptible to poverty. Such pressures affect men who have been socialised to think of themselves as 'breadwinners'. In particular, established gender roles may cause men to see the deterioration in employment as a personal failing, instead of a systemic economic problem.

The coping strategies adopted at the household level in response to negative economic shocks underscore the importance of taking these dynamics into account when considering the linkages between growth, employment and poverty. For countries with well-developed social welfare systems, government policies mitigate these negative consequences.

However, for countries without publicly supported systems of social protection, households and communities become a safety net of last resort. An additional link exists between paid employment, non-market work and human development. The ability to translate access to paid employment into new capabilities, greater freedom and improved investments in children depends on the nature of relationships within the household and the process by which decisions are made concerning the allocation of labour time and economic resources. Indeed, increased gender inequalities, even in the short-run, can have long-term consequences for economic growth and human development.

Therefore, it is critical to incorporate the gender dimension into the growth-employment-poverty nexus. Otherwise, the picture will not be fully understood and the implementation of an effective development strategy will be compromised.

#### **Social Vulnerability And Employment**

The two 'feminisations'—of labour and of poverty—do not provide an adequate framework for understanding the connections between employment and poverty risk. For example, the 'feminisation of labour' may be a response to, instead of a cause of, increases in precarious employment around the world. Similarly, the gendered dynamics of poverty are complex and also have implications for the well-being of children and men.

Therefore, poverty risk cannot be reduced to simple indicators, such as female headship. Instead, we need a framework for linking employment and poverty, which takes into account gendered interactions at three levels:

- the household level;
- at the level of intra-household dynamics; and
- the individual level.

Only by analysing the employment-poverty nexus at each of these three levels, will an adequate analysis be produced. Despite this call for a more complex analysis of the connections between gender relations, employment and poverty, one fact remains clear: women's paid employment is an essential factor determining the risk of poverty that families face. Women's employment contributes to total household income; women's participation in the labour market can affect intra-household bargaining outcomes, conditional on decision-making processes and who controls the income; and access to employment has important implications for individual freedoms, capabilities and dignity. Exactly how women's employment affects social and economic wellbeing will depend on the institutional context and the specific prevailing gender relations.

# IX. External Impediments And Internal Weaknesses Of Gender Mainstreaming

A major weakness of the term "Gender Mainstreaming" is that there is still little consensus over its definition. According to the group of specialists commissioned by the Council of Europe (2004), while all definitions focus on the broad goal of obtaining gender equality, the term "gender equality" is not necessarily mentioned. Many definitions merely describe the strategy itself, often reducing the definition to partial aspects of Gender Mainstreaming. In this case Gender Mainstreaming is seen as an

end in itself. Some definitions focus on the effects of Gender Mainstreaming and changes it can potentially instigate in the society. Very often, literature related to Gender Mainstreaming does not define the term at all. Finally, the word Mainstreaming is difficult to translate into many languages, and has therefore often been reduced to terms such as "gender-based approach".

#### **Gender Mainstreaming And The Policy Revolution**

Burton and Pullock (2000) feel that Gender Mainstreaming has been misleadingly shown to be a simple yet revolutionary concept which is able to put together all the public policy tools for the service of gender. They note that Gender Mainstreaming has become "an institutional isomorphism", whereby a norm, once adopted in a particular institutional setting, diffuses quickly to a wide range of other institutions whose members accept the legitimacy of that norm without question. According to Verloo (2001), once formally committed to pursuing a Gender Mainstreaming strategy, organisations are compelled to take steps which prove adherence to this strategy, even if these were superficial measures. A similar point is made by Jahan (1995) when she draws a distinction between the integrationist and agenda-setting versions of a Gender Mainstreaming strategy. She explains that in its integrationist form, gender equality concerns are introduced within existing structures.

# **Commitment And Gender Machinery**

Special gender units and machineries are given the task of developing and sustaining a visible commitment to gender equality. By contrast, an agenda-setting or transformative version of this strategy seeks to overhaul not only policy-making procedures but also policy paradigms involving a complete reorientation of the organisation from a gender perspective. Women are expected to play a proactive leadership role in making gender concerns the responsibility of everyone in the organisation. Although Jahan (1995) favors the latter approach as she believes it can transform the organisation into a gender-responsive entity, it is the former much toned-downed version which has been adopted by international organisations in practice (Razavi and Miller 1995a). Even in its benign form, Gender Mainstreaming nonetheless challenges the existing allocations of authority, resources and cultural norms in an organisation (March et al 1999).

According to Verloo (2001), the changes which this strategy proposes are often considered radical by conservatives in the organisation who reject the policy outright. Even the more liberal groups do not wholeheartedly endorse the strategy, finding repugnant the idea of interventions which would entail fault-finding and finger-pointing. Thus Gender Mainstreaming becomes a controversial policy from the very start and continues to endure overwhelming political constraints in the organisation.

#### **Technical Hitches**

There are numerous technical difficulties associated with this strategy, as well. Hafner and Pullock (2002) note that Gender Mainstreaming is an extraordinarily demanding strategy, requiring the inclusion of a gender perspective by all the central actors in the policy process, many of whom may have least interest in gender issues. Processes must fulfill several prerequisites before Gender Mainstreaming can produce desired results. These prerequisites include: a strong political will to create a consensus on, and a culture of, gender equality; equal opportunities legislation and anti-discrimination laws; research and training on gender equality issues; awareness-raising about gender equality; reliable statistics comprising data that are relevant for both women and men and that are split up by sex as well as by other background variables; context-specific and comprehensive knowledge of gender relations in the society; know-how of various policy process aspects, for example what actors are normally involved, which steps are normally taken, who is normally responsible etc.; funds and human resources necessary for sustaining a long-term commitment to gender equity; participation of women in political and public life and in decision-making processes etc. [Council of Europe (2004); March et al (1999)]. The list seems never-ending, and so are the practical challenges to Gender Mainstreaming.

#### **Challenges Of Meeting The Gender Policy Targets**

As can be expected, when ambitious public policies for Gender advancement are announced without meeting preconditions for their effective implementation, the unrealistic targets thus set are rarely achieved. Institutional machineries set up for this purpose along with their paraphernalia merely serve as signals to the acknowledgement of the importance of gender issues. However, government ministries are very often feeble, under-resourced, and susceptible to the shifting political circumstances of political parties (March et al., 1999). Even where these machineries have initiated Gender Mainstreaming programmes, these suffer from several dysfunctionalities. For example, the Council of Europe (2004)

notes that the focus is on activities which yield quick and visible results like producing policy documents, data sets, programme guidelines etc. According to Verloo, (2001), programmes are implemented in a top-down manner, without active involvement of the people for whom the programmes are designed. Verloo, (2001) also finds that even though programmes are designed to have an impact on the entire system, they are usually selectively implemented.

Sen (1999) observes that the responsibility to deal with operational issues of gender reform programmes falls to the middle and lower level managers who are often less gender sensitized than top level management. As mechanisms for monitoring and accountability are weak, instructions that are endorsed may not be directly challenged, but are not automatically followed. Practical success is also hampered due to the fact that programme objectives are too broad and ambiguous and lack specific indicators of success. Sen's observations are confirmed by Woodward, (2008) who also finds that preoccupation with financial practices, HRD policies, operational guidelines and so on often lead to a lack of clarity on the ultimate goals of the Gender Mainstreaming strategy which is attainment of gender equality. In practice, "gender equality" itself becomes quite a contentious concept when applied in several countries, all with different social and economic circumstances, different policy cultures and different understanding of gender relations (Council of Europe, 2004).

# What Is Best Practice Regarding Gender Mainstreaming?

The latest trend in development literature is to study "Best Practices" of countries and organisations where the Gender Mainstreaming concept has delivered desirable results. Application of these models proves difficult in situations which are substantially different from ones where these practices were developed. Contextualizing these success stories is in itself an innovative endeavor. Unfortunately, large organisations, especially those of the public sector, are notorious for lacking the capacity to innovate.

On a societal level, Gender Mainstreaming is called a people-oriented approach because it tries to incorporate the needs and preferences of all the people in the society and tries to elicit their support (March et al., 1999). In reality though, there has been a lack of ownership of this process (Verloo, 2001). According to Sen (1999), patriarchal resistance to questioning of women's subordination remains part of the culture in most of the developing world where this strategy is seen as being enforced at the behest of donor agencies to further their own ulterior agenda.

#### **A Question Of Power**

Gender activists and womens' organisers on the other hand, believe that gender equality cannot be institutionalized without dismantling hierarchies of power within those very organs of power. They feel that Gender Mainstreaming with its emphasis on working within the system, only diverts attention away from real political issues debilitating women's emancipation (Sen ,1999).

Gender mainstreaming is now a fifteen year old concept. Sen (1999) finds that there is a high level of disenchantment, not only with the concept of Gender Mainstreaming, but also with the prospect of any further discussion on its tenets. Similarly, Woodward (2008) holds that a major advantage of the Gender Mainstreaming approach was its originality, both as a technique and in its genesis as originating from an international governance and public policy source. The novelty has however worn off and support for Gender Mainstreaming has waned. So does this mean that Gender Mainstreaming is no longer a valid or relevant approach in today's world? To answer this question fairly, the advantages of this concept must be revisited and its achievements must be recognised.

# X. The Way Forward: Future Prospects For The Gender Mainstreaming Strategy

Following are some of the achievements of the Gender Mainstreaming strategy in developing countries. First, to a certain extent, this strategy has enabled institutionalisation of gender issues. There is pressure on governments to take initiatives for women's advancement seriously, as regular reports to parliament or international authorities have to be submitted. This has created space for civil society and women's rights activists to highlight gender injustices and to push for reforms which can help elevate women's status (March et al.,1999). Second, after overcoming initial resistance, national apparatuses and mechanisms have finally been put in place. Local expertise to deal with gender issues has started to be developed and institutional practices are becoming gender-aware if not gender responsive. A third positive outcome of Gender Mainstreaming has been the development of new horizontal governance groups, questioning underlying policy paradigms and forming support networks within national agencies to promote the gender agenda (Woodward, 2008). Fourth, gender-sensitivity training, at the very minimum, has helped in the inclusion of men in the debate on gender equality issues now. While these achievements seem extremely humble, it should be remembered that public policy approaches for

women's advancement in developing countries prior to Gender Mainstreaming could not even attain this level of success.

## **Dilemmas of Gender Mainstreaming**

While there are arguably many practical problems associated with the Gender Mainstreaming strategy, its concept still offers many advantages over other approaches to gender equality. First, it is a reconciliatory approach and considers men and women in a relational context and not as opposing forces. Secondly, Gender Mainstreaming is an umbrella approach complementing the equal treatment of men and women and targeted gender equality policies. It has a wide scope and it can potentially be applied to all kinds of development settings from poverty alleviation and conflict resolution to environmental protection. Third, it deals with structural issues impeding development and aims at institutional restructuring for sustained progress on gender equality. Fourth, as the Gender Mainstreaming strategy tries to address the root cause of gender discrimination, its positive outcomes may not become visible in the near term, but in the long-run institutional reform can be stimulated if this approach is consistently followed. Fifth, Gender Mainstreaming entails reorientation of policy processes and procedures in all departments of the organisation towards gender equality. Thus it creates an opportunity for development of synergy between the various departments of an organisation undergoing reform through this process. For example, gender-responsive budgeting in the finance department can make resources available for gender-analysis of technical departments which in turn identifies the best use of these resources to fulfill practical and strategic gender needs. Similarly, a gender audit conducted by a planning or human resource department can monitor the progress of gender interventions in the organisation. These exercises will have to be preceded by specialized gender training which will also gender-sensitize the participants. Thus coordinating Gender Mainstreaming programmes can reduce costs and improve outcomes.

## "Gender Fatigue"

The Gender Mainstreaming approach is currently suffering from problems posed by what is called the "issue-attention cycle" (Woodward 2008). This approach was portrayed as a means of guaranteed success by gender and development experts and international organisations in the 1990s. Now that the euphoria of this strategy has waned with results patchy at best, its limitations are being sorely realized.

A similar chain of events had happened in the 1970s and 1980s when first the Welfare then the WOMEN In Development approaches were launched one after the other among much fanfare and later fell out of favor and discarded. Experience proves that, each approach is as good as its practitioner and there is no universal solution to dealing with gender and development issues. A critical difference can be made by the manner in which the Gender Mainstreaming strategy is implemented. If it can be ensured that the process of implementation is congruent with the larger goals of the organisation, it would result not only in changes in women's condition, but would also challenge and change the structures and systems which create gender inequality within the organisation (Sen, 1999).

Improper implementation or lack of political will should not be the reason for discarding an innovative concept like Gender Mainstreaming. If institutions and processes do not live up to their commitments, it is not due to the inadequacy of the concept, but rather due to perverse cultural practices like corruption which plague these institutions. Rooting out malpractices from public sector organisations should therefore be a priority of the government if successful implementation of development strategies, like Gender Mainstreaming, is to become a reality.

## The Context And Conditions For Effective Development

Any given development approach will have more chances of delivering desirable results if it responds to the conditions and challenges of a particular era. According to UNRISD (2005) the "war against terror" has led to a growing sense of insecurity, animosity and cynicism among the international community. Failure of neo-liberal globalisation to deliver on its promise of improving people's lives in developing countries has led to further distrust of reforms endorsed by international agencies. Gender issues in particular have become highly contentious due to a rise in "Identity-Politics" in the developing world. In these difficult times Molyneux and Razavi (2006) advise scholars and policy makers to recognise that the multifaceted process of social transformation does not follow a unidirectional path and there are few guaranteed solutions.

Social and economic development may not always enlarge the realm of human choice and development may not always be based on one description of modernity. They call for social reform based on understanding and respect of a diversity of cultures. The effort then should be to merge varied opinions under one over-arching agenda and to come up with negotiated solutions which suit everyone's interest

to some degree. This, in effect, is the Gender Mainstreaming approach. It must be realized though that reaching a real consensus on gender issues is not an easy task. So while the concept of Gender Mainstreaming may still be viable in the current times, the future of this strategy rests on how tactfully it is implemented.

#### The Public Sector as an Anchor for Development

The importance of the public sector in implementing public policies and delivering social justice cannot be ignored especially in times of global economic recession. As the Gender Mainstreaming strategy focuses on organisational procedures, policies and operational guidelines, it is the ideal strategy for bringing about institutional reform in the public sector which has well defined rules and procedures for nearly every activity undertaken. It must be borne in mind though that unlike in the private sector where price and market mechanisms help in the identification of profitable activities, in the public sector it is difficult to define which activities best serve public interest even if the democratic system functions smoothly.

## **Gender Mainstreaming As An Externally Imposed Obligation**

A word of caution for governments of developing countries, who are encouraged to adopt the gender mainstreaming strategy by international donor agencies, would be that the limitations of a preferred approach are often suppressed and its benefits highlighted. If the Gender Mainstreaming strategy is to produce significant results in the public sector organisations of developing countries, then its limitations must be understood and local solutions be developed to overcome them. Further, national agencies responsible for implementation of gender reform policies may be well advised to facilitate the motivation of public sector staff as least as much as the consultants hired to plan public sector reform programmes. It must be appreciated that staff motivation is more important in obtaining meaningful results than beautifully designed pamphlets and impressive web-sites. Public servants can act as catalysts of change only if the conditions for Gender Mainstreaming are favorable within public sector organisations themselves.

# XI. Macroeconomic Policies And Gender Equality

Although often difficult to perceive, macroeconomic policy has real implications for individual well-being. In the past two decades, a substantial body of research has clarified how broad macroeconomic policies directly affect the particular demographics of a country. We consider gender-responsive budgeting and trade policy specifically.

#### **How Budgets Respond To Women**

Gender-Responsive Budgeting entails the incorporation of a gender-sensitive perspective into the design, development, adoption, and execution of all budgetary processes. Gender-responsive budgeting aims to promote equitable, effective, and appropriate resource allocation and to establish adequate budgetary allocations to support gender equality (United Nations, 1995). Because budgets set forth a government's priorities and the commitment of financial expenditures to achieve those priorities, gender-responsive budgeting has been recognised as central to the achievement of gender equality (UNFPA & UNIFEM, 2006). Government budgets are assumed to be gender-neutral because they are generally presented in financial aggregates, with no specific references to men or women. However, recent studies demonstrate that gender-insensitive macroeconomic policies produce different impacts on men and women. For example, because women usually earn less than men and their work lives are more likely to be interrupted for family-related matters, women contribute less to welfare funds and therefore receive lower average social welfare payments (Rubin & Bartle, 2005). Rubin & Bartle (2005) also find that reductions in government spending on healthcare are likely to increase the amount of time that women spend in care-related work to compensate for the lost public services.

The gender insensitivity of macroeconomic policies not only impedes progress toward gender equality but also results in inefficient budgeting allocations, thus hindering economic growth. By recognizing and accounting for gender-differentiated needs, gender-responsive budgeting contributes to improved economic efficiency through better-informed financial allocations (Balmori, 2003). Because gender-responsive budgeting provides a means of assessing whether stated objectives have been achieved, it can also produce better regulatory quality through increased government transparency, accountability,

predictability, and participation, which are preconditions for sustainable economic growth (Rubin & Bartle, 2005). Last but not least, in light of persistent inequalities in terms of human rights, including education and health, gender-responsive budgeting is a powerful policy instrument to "situate people's rights at the core of their policies" (Rubin & Bartle, 2005; Durojaye, Keevy, & Oluduro, 2010).

# XII. South Africa in the Global Economy

The recent global crisis, originating in financial liberalization, longstanding 'free' trade policies and laissez faire promotion in general, has resulted in uneven and rather discouraging socioeconomic outcomes around the world. For the most part, the expectation that market efficiency would accompany deregulation, reduction of budget deficits, and price stability, i.e., channel investment where most needed, did not come to pass. The much anticipated poverty reduction and more equitable income distribution impacts proved elusive as well. Furthermore, higher growth rates did not generate sufficient demand to absorb surplus labour. These issues are connected but an in depth discussion is beyond the scope of this short note. Instead we will concentrate on the challenge of joblessness.

#### **Trickle Down**

Perplexed governments, international development agencies, and the Bretton Woods institutions have finally began to understand that the "trickle down" effects do not always take place, and in any event, not in an appropriate or equitable fashion. Particularly troubling and beyond loss of income, joblessness and poverty are associated with marginalization and social exclusion, susceptibility to extremist ideologies, subjection of people to high levels of violence and criminality and overall loss of hope. There is therefore a particular urgency to engage in policy dialogue and pursue new directions and by now, it is acknowledged that fresh ideas are needed.

In the search for new directions, we must keep in mind that since poverty and inequality are the result of different processes, one size will not fit all. To give some examples, meagre wages and unregulated work conditions, being on the brink of becoming landless or lacking the skills to be eligible for better paying existing vacancies, each clearly requires a different type of intervention and hence points to distinct policy recommendations.

#### **Public Works and Public Good**

There also exists another group of people whose economic suffering is largely based on chronic and severe lack of employment opportunities. In such instances, "public work programmes" and "employment guarantee schemes," whereby the government becomes the employer of last resort (ELR), can go a long way. These are sometimes referred to as 'active labour market policies', and there have been many such country experiences; at its core, such a policy makes it the obligation of the state to provide a paid work entitlement to those ready and willing but unable to find a job. Historically, such job opportunities have been created primarily in construction and maintenance of physical infrastructural assets. Often bypassed are equally meaningful jobs that enhance social service delivery, a subject matter this note is dedicated to.

Specifically, this policy brief presents the findings of a research project undertaken to examine the macroeconomic consequences of scaling-up the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP), a public job creation initiative introduced by the South African government in 2004. The job creation we propose pertains to social service delivery in health and education, especially important areas when current backlogs are taken into account. For households that cannot purchase such services due to lack of income, public provisioning gaps are devastating and are mostly filled by long hours of invisible, unpaid work performed by women and children.

Time use data reveals this to be the case in many countries, resulting in yet another form of gender inequality, and South Africa is not an exception. The employment creation we propose therefore addresses several policy objectives: income and job generation, provisioning of unmet needs of communities, skill enhancement for a new cadre of workers, and promotion of gender equality by addressing the overtaxed time of women.

Domestic labour resource mobilisation through well-designed public employment programmes presents an opportunity to achieve multiple developmental policy objectives. For the case of South Africa, we find that public job creation synergistically creates jobs and income, expands fiscal space, promotes propoor growth and contributes to gender equality by substituting paid for unpaid work. These results stem from an ex-ante evaluation of a policy scenario for South Africa's EPWP. The orders of magnitude

involved are indeed compelling and we hope they are useful in motivating discussion for other countries.

## XIII. Market Participation And Gender Equality

We first consider the broad intersection of gender and the labour force. We note that a lack of access to child care constrains women's wage-work. We discuss barriers to women's business ownership, under entrepreneurship and credit access. Finally, we consider the gender dimensions of economic growth in the agricultural sector.

## **Labour Force Participation and Wages**

A review of the literature on the relationship between gender equality in employment and wages and economic growth yields conflicting results. Generally, the literature indicates that gender equality in employment and earning impacts economic growth through three broad mechanisms:

• Allocative efficiency, demographic effect, and bargaining power of women in the household. Gender inequality in employment results in allocative inefficiency by artificially reducing the supply of labour available to employers. Using panel data from 1961 to 1991 for 16 states in India, Esteve-Volart (2004) finds that the ratio of female-to-male managers and the ratio of female-to-male workers are positively related to total output per capita. Specifically, a 10 percent increase in the female-to-male ratio of managers improves per-capita output by 2 percent, while a 10 percent increase in the female-to-male ratio of all workers expands per-capita output by 8 percent.

Some researchers find that women are better suited to certain jobs compared to men, which has important implications for women's wages. For example, Galor and Weil (1996) determine that, as the capital per worker increases, women's relative wages likewise increase because capital is more complementary to women's labour inputs than to those of men. The reduction of gender inequality in employment and pay can lead to economic growth through the demographic effect that accompanies reduced fertility. Galor and Weil (1996) find that as women's relative wages increase, fertility rates fall. This reduced fertility in turn raises the capital per worker, which ultimately leads to increased output and higher per-capita incomes.

#### **Wage Discrimination And Output**

Cavalcanti and Tavares (2007) find that wage discrimination leads to lower output per capita, directly due to a decrease in female labour force participation and indirectly through an increase in fertility. As women's employment and earnings increase, their bargaining power in terms of decision making within the household is likewise enhanced (Klasen & Lamanna, 2009). This improved bargaining power can lead to economic growth in several ways. First, it results in a higher aggregate savings rate because women have a greater propensity to save than do men (Floro & Seguino, 2002).

Second, it leads to increased investments in health and education for children, allowing for future economic growth (World Bank, 3 2001). As suggested earlier, our review of the relevant literature indicates that gender inequality in employment and pay can actually contribute to economic growth. For example, Blecker and Seguino (2002) find that high gender pay gaps, and specifically low female wages, enhance the competitiveness of export-oriented semi-industrialized nations. Busse and Spielmann (2006) likewise determine that gendered wage inequality is positively associated with comparative advantage in labour-intensive goods.

#### **Women's Labour Participation And Social Reproduction**

Women's labour force participation is constrained by the need to care for young children. Research finds that the price of child care has nontrivial effects on women's workforce participation rates (Connelly, DeGraff, & Levinson, 1996; Wong & Levine, 1992). When a mother cannot command high wages and cannot rely on family members to provide child care, she is less likely to engage in wage work. Employing data from Kenya, Lokshin et al. demonstrate that the high costs associated with formal child care discourages mothers from pursuing wage work (Lokshin, Glinskaya, & Garcia, 2004). Evidence from Togo, Brazil, and Guatemala likewise confirms that women's labour force participation is enhanced when low-cost childcare options are readily available. Less clear, however, is whether women's wages improve as access to child care expands (Tabbert, 2009; Hallman, 2003; Deutsch).

Several countries in Latin America have piloted home-based childcare programmes, in which one mother is responsible for the care of 10-15 neighborhood children. This model is relatively inexpensive for both the government and participating families, allows mothers to enter the workforce, and

produces longterm positive effects for enrolled children (Attanasio & VeraHernandez, 2004; Ruel, 2002). Such community arrangements and other low-cost childcare options help to facilitate women 's equal access to the labour market. Lack of access to childcare likewise dampens the secondary school enrollment rates of older, female siblings. When a mother opts to engage in wage-work but lacks access to affordable child care, her daughters serve as substitutes for home production and care of younger children (Lokshin, Glinskaya, & Garcia, 2004). Adolescent girls in Kenya are 41 percent less likely to attend secondary school when a child under the age of 3 resides in their household (Deolalikar, 1998). In sum, convincing evidence finds that the provision of low-cost child care not only enhances women's access to the labour market, it also improves secondary education rates for girls.

## XIV. Entrepreneurship And Economic Development

The government plays an important role in fostering a vibrant business climate by minimizing unnecessary regulation and ensuring that markets function efficiently. The government supports markets by providing a legal infrastructure and allowing entrepreneurs to easily join markets and conduct transactions. As explained above, an expansion of women's income facilitates poverty alleviation; it is therefore problematic that women constitute the minority of registered business owners (Boserup, 2007). Women do, however, often appear to fulfill an entrepreneurial role in informal businesses (Charmes, 2000). Despite an apparent link between an entrepreneur's gender and participation in the formal economy, we found no studies to suggest that laws or regulations regarding business start-up and transactions are the cause of women's exclusion (Ahl, 2006).

## **Gender Inequality In Entrepreneurship**

In theory, gender inequality in entrepreneurship and in access to the resources required to start a business leads to allocative inefficiency, which in turn negatively impacts economic growth. However, literature that examines the impact of gender equality in entrepreneurship on economic growth is limited, particularly for low-income and lower middle-income countries. In addition, the few studies that do exist yield inconclusive results. Bardasi et al. (2007) suggest that gender-specific barriers do have an adverse impact on enterprise development, productivity, and competitiveness in Africa. On the other hand, some researchers argue that women are more likely to choose to invest their extra earnings on their family's welfare and, as a result, women may forgo opportunities to expand their businesses.

Kevane and Wydick (2001) find that female entrepreneurs do not hire as many employees as do their male counterparts (implying that women-owned businesses are not growing as fast) during childbearing years.

De Mel et al. (2009) report higher social returns from female-owned businesses supported by microfinance than from similar male-owned businesses. Based on the current lack of empirical evidence, it is difficult to generalize whether and how gender equality in entrepreneurship contributes to economic growth.

#### **Credit Access**

Substantial literature dating to the 1960s unequivocally demonstrates the imperative of functioning credit markets for economic growth (see Carter, Waters, Branch, Ito, & Ford, 2004). Credit minimizes three common impediments to an efficient economy: risk constraints, or the ability to share risk among investors; liquidity constraints, or the ability to maintain sufficient cash flows for daily operation; and savings constraints, or efficient methods of investing extra capital (Boucher, Barham, & Carter, 2005). Recent microeconomic literature focuses on the effects of credit on borrower household expenditure and wealth and in particular on women borrowers.

Initially, two economic rationales existed for offering more financial products to women:

- women traditionally were excluded from conventional credit markets, and
- women faced significant economic barriers that could be overcome through access to credit.

The results of early studies suggested a third rationale: providing credit access to women may have a greater effect on poverty reduction than offering the same to men (Morris & Meyer, 1993; Besley, 1995; Khandker & Chowdbury, 2005). According to one estimate, after eight years with credit access, female borrowers can bring their families above the poverty line and sustain themselves there (Khandker & Chowdbury, 2005). In addition, some literature suggests that credit access enhances women's autonomy and affects household family planning decisions (Amin & Li, 1996; Amin, Becker, & Bayes, 1998). Despite an abundance of recent literature on credit and gender, there is reason to doubt the "generalisability" of these findings. Many of the studies are from novel microcredit programmes in South Asia and may not be applicable worldwide. Moreover, some economists argue that increasing credit access to women

rather than to men has a larger economic effect because women are generally more credit constrained (Berger, 1999). As access to credit equalizes, so may the positive outcomes (Morris & Meyer, 1993). Empirical literature supports the argument for gender equality in credit access but has yet to commit to the strong theory that women merit preferential credit access.

## XV. Gender and Infrastructure Development

Infrastructure development (including water, sanitation, transportation, energy provision, and telecommunications) has traditionally been a top-down process dominated by technological concerns, with little social engagement. Most literature on the relationship between infrastructure development and economic growth lacks a gender-sensitive perspective. However, it has become increasingly apparent that a failure to provide adequate and affordable infrastructure facilities and services according to gender-differentiated needs can have negative economic and social implications (Masika & Baden, 1997). Below we outline the mechanisms by which a failure to incorporate a gender perspective in infrastructure development can impede economic growth.

## **Perceptions of Infrastructure**

Research on the impact of a micro hydro-electricity plant in Sri Lanka shows striking evidence of gender-differentiated perceptions of infrastructure services: men saw the benefits of electricity in terms of leisure, quality of life, and education for their children; women saw it as providing the means for reducing their workload, improving health, and reducing household expenditures (Barnett, 2000). This is a clear example of how a gender-based division of labour (in which women are responsible for domestic needs, including water, household energy supply, and sanitation) has resulted in gender-differentiated needs and preferences for infrastructure.

Gender-related differences in physical attributes restrict women's access to infrastructure. Masika & Baden (1997) demonstrate that water pumps, introduced to provide clean water, with handles designed for use by men have failed because women and children (the principal water bearers in the community) are unable to operate them. Certain features of culture and custom also constrain women's access to infrastructure.

### Women's Representation In the Discourse On Infrastructure

In Africa, for example, because of the importance women place on safety, security, and privacy, as well as men's reluctance to allow vehicles to be used for "women's tasks," women are under-represented in the ownership and operation of motorized and non-motorized vehicles for the transportation of agricultural goods (Amponsah, Turner, Grieco, & Guitink, 1996). Women's relatively weak property and economic rights (e.g., access to credit) compound with inequalities in intra-household relations to constrain women's ability to afford infrastructure facilities and services (Doran, 1990).

Due to limited access to land titles, women are often unable to secure the credit necessary to make infrastructure improvements. Female-headed households are particularly vulnerable in low-income countries, where they cannot secure loans for private infrastructure improvements and public finance is inadequate to address all infrastructure needs. Gender-sensitive infrastructure development can benefit the economy through linkages with enhanced access to credit and markets, improved health, and greater educational attainment. Infrastructure development that is targeted to women's needs reduces the demands on women's time from domestic responsibilities.

#### **Time Use And Infrastructure Benefits**

The time saved can instead be invested in activities that are more beneficial to the economy (e.g. income-generating activities through access to credit or markets), thereby improving overall economic efficiency (Masika & Baden, 1997). Grown et al. (2005) and Mwaniki et al. (2002) find that improving the accessibility and affordability of transportation services increases women's and children's use of health services. Guio-Torres & Taylor (2006) find that taking women's needs into account when improving sanitation facilities increases women's use of these facilities, reduces violence against women, and makes the maintenance and cleaning tasks of women easier.

Furthermore, gender-sensitive sanitation projects improve girls' school attendance. Recognizing gender-differentiated needs and preferences for infrastructure improves efficiency by optimizing the use of limited funds and human resources (Guio-Torres & Taylor, 2006). In sum, the incorporation of a gender-sensitive perspective in infrastructure development can benefit economic growth through a variety of

mechanisms. Still, without fundamental gender equality in land rights, economic rights, health, and education, infrastructure development alone is insufficient for economic growth.

## XVI. Environmental Management

While preserving the environment is widely recognised as an important aspect of sustainable economic growth, introducing a gender perspective into this causal relationship is a relatively new notion. Preliminary linkages between gender and the environment and the implications of these linkages for poverty reduction have been identified. Guio-Torres & Taylor (2006) estimate that 90 percent of the world's 1.1 billion poor rely on the environment for at least a fraction of their income through small-scale farming, fishing, hunting, and the collection of firewood, herbs, or other natural products. In poor households where the gender-based division of labour is especially pronounced, women are responsible for meeting domestic needs, including water, food, and sanitation. Therefore, women are disproportionately vulnerable when the environment suffers. Although the direct benefits of introducing a gender-sensitive perspective into environmental management have not been adequately examined, the potential mechanisms through which gender equality in environmental management may impact economic growth are fairly clear. We summarize these mechanisms below.

### **Perspectives On Environmental Management**

First, a gender-sensitive perspective in environmental management has the potential to significantly affect women's health, safety, and well-being. Because of the gender-based division of labour, when the environment suffers, women often stand to lose their local means of subsistence; as a result, they may need to travel longer distances to collect needed environmental goods, thus facing higher levels of mental, economic, and social stress (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, 2002; Guio-Torres & Taylor, 2006). Scientific evidence demonstrates that women are generally more vulnerable to chemical pollution than men because women tend to have higher percentages of body fat, which traps environment toxins (United Nations Environment Programme, 2005). Generally, because women live and work comparatively closer contact with nature, environmental pollution can have a more significant impact on women's health. Second, the misalignment between the supply of resources and the needs and preferences of women, the primary users of these resources, can result in diminished

household supply, which in turn decreases economic efficiency and even threatens the health and well-being of all household members. Research by Dankelman (2005) finds that women's knowledge of and interest in environmental resources are often ignored in environmental management decision-making and development planning.

#### **Benefits Of Partnership**

Enhancing women's participation in environmental management can result in better technology selection, earnings equity and capacity, and environmental stewardship (Guio-Torres & Taylor, 2006). These improvements reduce the time women spend in resource collection and increase household access to essential resources, leading to greater economic efficiency (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2002; Guio-Torres & Taylor, 2006; Lwanga, 2001). Third, because of women's comparatively limited access to education, their ability to make informed and sustainable choices is constrained. Women's overexploitation of resources endangers the environment and threatens economic growth (Skutsch, 1996; Gurung, Thapa, & Gurung, 2000; Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, 2002; Clancy, 2003; Guio-Torres & Taylor, 2006). At the same time, women appear to be better attuned to the needs of the environment and more committed to its protection than men, provided that women have access to the necessary knowledge and are permitted to participate in decision-making (United Nations Environment Programme, 2005). In this regard, giving women equal access to knowledge and decision-making in environmental resource management can better preserve the resources needed for sustainable economic growth.

# XVII. Early Childhood Development and Education

Towards the end of 20th century, children became the renewed focus of international attention. In November 1989, the United Nations General Assembly formally adopted the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), which was ratified "more quickly and by more countries than any other human rights instrument" (Annan 2001, 1). Acknowledging that "learning begins at birth" (UNESCO n.d.), in 1990 at the World Conference on Education for All in Jomtien, Thailand, the global community pledged to "universalize primary education and massively reduce illiteracy by the end of the decade" (UNESCO

1995). Ten years later, at the follow-up conference in Dakar, Senegal, delegates took stock of the global failure to meet those targets and committed themselves to six education goals to be achieved by 2015. The first of these goals was "expanding and improving early childhood care and education, especially for the world's most vulnerable and disadvantaged children" (UNESCO 2000). That same year, when United Nations member states signed the Millennium Declaration, young children's needs and development were recognized as key to reaching the overarching Millennium Development Goal (MDG) of eradicating poverty by 2015 (United Nations Secretary General 2006).

#### The Cost of Childhood

It is argued, however, that none of these global targets can be reached without significant investments in early childhood (UNESCO 2006). In its 4 Cornerstones to Secure a Strong Foundation for Young Children, the Consultative Group on Early Childhood Care and Development (2010) asserts:

The real crisis in education is in early primary – yet it receives almost no attention. By the time more money and resources are put into the later years of school, it is too late for the many who have already dropped out of school altogether.

... "Good quality early primary education improves the efficiency of the schooling system and saves money by improving achievement and reducing repetition and drop-out. It dramatically improves the chances of meeting the targets of EFA and the Millennium Development Goals. The return on investment is magnified when quality early primary schooling is combined with early childhood services prior to children entering school (1-2)".

Grantham-McGregor and colleagues (2007) estimate that more than 219 million children under age 5 will not reach their developmental potential due to illness, malnutrition, and a lack of nurturing care, early stimulation, and education. This reality "places an enormous burden on the children, their families, and their societies" (Black et al. 2008, 455).

Extensive brain research shows that 80% of a child's brain growth and synapse development occurs before the age of 3 (Gopnik 1999; McCain and Mustard 1999; Mustard 2007; Shonkoff and Phillips 2000; Shore 1997). Vargas-Barón (2009) contends:

The period of gestation to age three is the foundation for all later growth and development. If children who are fragile, pre-term, low-birth weight, at-risk, developmentally delayed or disabled do not receive appropriate, quality ECD services, they will never reach their inborn potential (10).

#### Considerations of ECD

According to UNAIDS (2010) the following considerations need to be made when considering Early Childhood Development and the support thereof:

- Existing resources and services available in the community;
- The likelihood of the intervention to respond quickly;
- The scale of the problem; (How many children are vulnerable and in which ways?)
- Opportunities to strengthen family and community capacity to protect and care for vulnerable children;
- Potential costs and sustainability of the interventions;
- Extent of community ownership;
- Quality of health care and psycho-social care available;
- Coping mechanisms in the local setting; (How is the community addressing the orphan problem? If family placement is not already available, can it be created?);
- National and local traditions, knowledge, attitudes, practices,
- Extent to which women as primary care-giver participate in the design and implementation of these programmes.

## **XVIII. Holistic Dimensions And Interventions Of Poverty Eradication**

Women and girls, often due to centuries of discrimination, are more likely to suffer from reduced psychosocial well-being, which increases their vulnerability to poverty. Many girls and women are hindered by gender stereotypes that prescribe that women have to submit themselves to men and do not feel confident enough to participate in development programmes or engage in social change and politics. Psychosocial needs are often considered less important than material needs. Nevertheless, the psychological state of a person or group highly impacts their ability to participate in and play an active role in sustainable development.

### **Risks To Psycho-Social Wellbeing**

War and conflict, oppression and violence, discrimination and stigmatization, illnesses and poverty are high risks to psychosocial well-being because they reduce a persons' ability to concentrate on and engage in development. Women and girls are particularly at risk because they lack self-esteem and confidence to participate in development activities that promote decision-making of women, political participation and gender equality. We are convinced that only after the psychosocial vulnerabilities of women and girls are addressed can development actions become efficient and sustainable.

## The Spiritual is Political

Emotional, spiritual and social needs also require attention. Psychosocial programming strengthens the capacity of individuals and communities to cope with stresses, particularly those associated with poverty, war, conflict, violence and disasters, by addressing well-being and in particular community feeling and focusing on a person's sense of value for self, others and life in general. With women this often means breaking the silence about violence, isolation, finding sense of solidarity with other women, learning new skills, expressing oneself and having a space for recreation, creative activities and opportunities to share with other women.

This is crucial for women and girls because they are often constrained by social norms so that they are usually not free to advance as they wish. The strong negative messages commonly associated with being female, plus the constant burden of chores and lack of appreciation lead to low self-esteem and confidence. In addition, most societies have norms that restrict women and girls in terms of movement, freedom to choose life paths, marriage partners or indeed any major choice in their lives. These restrictions can lead to a downward disempowering spiral. Daily violence and grinding poverty can increase vulnerability and reduce capacities.

#### **Political Dynamics Of Care Work**

The dynamics of care are receiving more attention from activists, researchers and policy actors today than they did 20, or even 10, years ago. The current public interest in care is not, however, without precedent. At the beginning of the twentieth century, care issues were also high on the public agenda in Europe, in particular, as a result of agitation by trade unions and some strands of the feminist movement. Putting in place social provisions such as the "family wage", pensions for single mothers and widows, maternity leave and labour protection for women reflected a certain recognition of the need to liberate people—especially mothers—from the obligation to do paid work so that they could perform care services (Knijn and Kremer 1997).

This resulted in the fortification of the heterosexual male-headed nuclear family, underpinned by ideological, legal and economic means at the disposal of the state. The male head of the household would be paid a family wage, sufficient to support children and a full-time wife and mother who performed domestic and care work without pay (Fraser 1997). Women's financial dependence on husbands was an integral feature of this model.

In more recent times, women's massive entry into the paid work force—a near-global trend— has squeezed the time hitherto allocated to the care of family and friends on an unpaid basis.

## **Factors Relating To The Environment Of Care Work**

While the decline in fertility across many regions means that there are fewer children to be cared for, demographic ageing in some countries and major health crises in others have intensified the need for care services. In many developing countries where public health services have been severely weakened during the decades of market-inspired reform, much of the care burden has inevitably fallen back on women and girls. In the more developed economies, paid care services have become a growing sector of the economy as a result of women's increasing participation in the paid labour force. These services, in turn, employ many women. In this context, the quality of care, and the pay and working conditions of carers, have become contested policy issues. Paid care services have been susceptible to competitive pressures that generate low-pay and low-quality services—adversely affecting both care workers and the recipients of care (Folbre 2006a).

The institutions involved in the provision of care may be conceptualized in a stylized fashion as a care diamond, to include the family/household, markets, the public sector and the not-for profit sector (including voluntary and community provision). The boundaries of the responsibility mix often shift in response to the claims of social networks and organized interest groups (for example, trade unions and women's groups) as well as through state action. The notion that countries often move back and forth across different sectors is important because it belies the view, deeply entrenched in the modernization narrative, of a linear path along which all countries move with an inevitable shift from "private" (family and voluntary) provision of care to "public" provision (by the state and market).

#### **Policy Responses to Care Work**

It is sometimes (wrongly) assumed that if issues of care were to be taken up by policy makers, then the only possible response would be to provide some kind of cash payment for women (for example, wages for housework or mothers' pensions). While this kind of demand may have been voiced historically by some women's rights advocates, it is not the kind of social provision that most modern-day advocates of women's rights prioritize. Ideally, society should recognize and value the importance of different forms of care, but without reinforcing care work as something that only women can or should do, given the well-known and adverse consequences of such gendering: women's financial precariousness and their exclusion from the public domain.

There is enormous diversity in currently existing policy responses to care—arguably greater than that found for other contingencies such as illness or unemployment, and with differing implications for gender equality. Gender advocates have put forward a range of proposals that attempt to overcome the many disadvantages endured by most women because of their responsibilities for caregiving, and sometimes to entice men to contribute more time to it. There are tensions, however, between the different proposals that have been put forward in terms of a wish to support and value care and to liberate women from the confines of caregiving so as to enable their more active presence in the public sphere. There is a wide range of possible policy interventions: cash payments in the form of a caregivers' allowance or a citizen's wage (more gender-neutral than a mothers' pension); taxation allowances; different types of paid and unpaid leave from employment; social security credits and social services. The analysis provided by feminist social policy researchers of the outcomes of these diverse provisions

in countries where they have been put in place provides useful lessons for "latecomers" in the area of care policy.

Care (whether paid or unpaid) is crucial to human well-being and to the pattern of economic development. Some analysts emphasize the significance of care for economic dynamism and growth. Others see care in much larger terms, as part of the fabric of society and integral to social development. Citizenship rights, the latter argue, have omitted the need to receive and to give care. To overcome the gender bias that is deeply entrenched in systems of social protection and to make citizenship truly inclusive, care must become a dimension of citizenship with rights that are equal to those that are attached to employment.

How problems of care are addressed by society has important implications for the achievement of gender equality, by either broadening the capabilities and choices of women and men, or confining women to traditional roles associated with femininity and motherhood. How care is addressed is at the same time inextricably intertwined with other structures of inequality, especially race and social class. Historically and across a diverse range of countries, women from disadvantaged racial and ethnic groups have tended to provide care services to meet the needs of the more powerful social groups, while their own needs for care have been downplayed and neglected. Analyses of care that falsely homogenize women's interests are thus deeply problematic.

## XIX. Measuring Unpaid Work Within A Macro Economic Framework

African countries do not conduct regular time use studies, which are emerging as a very useful statistical tool for collecting detailed information about how individuals spend their time, on a daily and weekly basis as an input to estimating the value of paid and unpaid work as well as the size of labour force in a country. Only five African countries have by 2005 conducted time-use surveys – most of which have not provided timely and adequately the required gender disaggregated statistics, which are not fully comparable between and within countries and may therefore be difficult to replicate and apply to other countries. There is now a strong sentiment from the international community that the lack of time use surveys in countries from which to measure the value of unpaid work is a significant data gap in statistical systems. Thus, the economic and social development discussions and policy decisions fail to

account for all economic activity – they exclude the undeniably enormous value added of household production and care services.

### **Time Use Surveys**

To redress these issues, ECA recently introduced a new round of annual time-use surveys in six African countries, which are cost-effective studies of a representative sample size of not more than 5,000 households per country. The surveys aim to provide a modern, scientific and cost-effective way to generate new, timely and more accurate figures of the complete economic system that would greatly enhance pro-poor policy formulation as well as improve modeling and forecasting of African economies towards achieving poverty reduction strategies and MDGs. The paper discusses the concepts and results of selected household surveys and their applications for preparing National Time Accounts (NTA) and National Satellite Accounts of Household Production (NSAHP). National Time Accounts for analysis of "time poverty" are presented along with NSAHP as the main framework for integrating gender perspectives and household production in national accounts, budgets and policies; and for constructing gender-aware micro-simulation and macroeconomic models.

#### **Six Critical Policy Areas**

Any strategy that seeks to engage women using feminist development approaches by stating the importance of unpaid work in development policy can do so within the context of six critical policy areas:

- policy for the reform of statistical systems:
- policies for promoting gender equality;
- (policies for the enhancement of women's employment and income;
- policies for the enhancement of women's well-being and quality of life;
- policies to reduce gender bias in macroeconomic policies; and
- policies to monitor impacts of policies on household production and poverty.

From its inception, therefore, one of the key challenges for feminist economics was to make visible the so-called invisible or unpaid economy. There is some dissonance, however, between those who highlight and seek to make visible the unpaid "economic" work of women and men, and those who emphasize

the unpaid care aspects of social reproduction. The latter has more recently come into usage and it continues to be dismissed as "non-economic" by the wider economic and statistical community.

### Challenging The Definition Of 'Work'

On the positive side, by highlighting women's participation in production, these researchers provided a timely challenge both to the definition of work (and "active labour") and to the methods of data collection used for generating official statistics. Their overall aim was to make visible areas of unvalorized or non-market production that tend to be disproportionately allocated to women. An important component of this endeavour was the attempt to deal with the much-debated category of generally unpaid "family labour". After much lobbying and hard work by a variety of networks, researchers and some governments, the System of National Accounts (SNA) was revised in 1993 to include two categories of unpaid work within the purview of national income that had been, hitherto, excluded:

- undercounted work, that is, the work that is not fully counted due to conceptual
  and methodological problems of data collection, often described as "difficult to measure
  sectors" within the market economy (this includes unpaid family work, home-based work, selfemployment work and other informal sector work); and
- uncounted work, that is, primarily subsistence work, the output of which is meant for selfconsumption (Hirway 2005:1).

Curiously, the relaxation of production boundaries was not applied to the production of services (as opposed to goods) for self-consumption, except for the own account production of housing services by owner-occupiers and of domestic and personal services produced by employing paid domestic staff (Hirway 2005:1). Effectively, this meant the exclusion of the following items from national accounts and from calculations of gross domestic product (GDP):

- preparation of meals, laundry, cleaning and shopping;
- care of children, the elderly, the sick and people with disabilities within the household; and
- volunteer services provided through organizations and groups.

The rationale given for this choice was threefold: (i) unpaid care services have limited repercussions on the rest of the economy; (ii) it is difficult to impute monetary values to unpaid care services; and (iii) the inclusion of unpaid care services will have adverse effects on the usefulness of the accounts for macroeconomic analysis and policy purposes and disturb the historical trends. But it was recommended that the unpaid work that is excluded from the SNA production boundary be measured as "extended economic work" (extended SNA or ESNA) and valued in "satellite accounts".

## XX. Feed-back from the SAWID Provincial Roundtables

"South African Women in Dialogue (SAWID) advocates a vision of women united in their diversity and acting together to become agents of their own development. The women of South Africa have identified poverty eradication as the cornerstone of their agenda for a better future, and SAWID has set out, not only to ensure that government is correctly configured for this mammoth task, but also to ensure that government has a poverty strategy in place and that the global macro-economic framework becomes inclusive of the unpaid work of women.

The Development Caravan, the poverty eradication model being piloted by SAWID since 2007, is one that trains Social Auxiliary Workers, sourced from the same poor neighbourhoods where the pilot studies are being conducted, to work with identified poor families to walk them out of poverty in over 3 to 5 years. It is a slow and painstaking process of weaving and re-weaving the fabric of family and society by doing the necessary work, linking people to existing services and resources, and coaching, mentoring and nurturing each individual member of every family. SAWID believes that this is the only way to create sustainable individuals, families and communities". (SAWID Article, Poverty Eradication Approach, 2011)

The feed- back from the engagements with a cross-section of primarily grassroots women across South Africa between September and November 2011 encapsulates concerns and narratives articulated by the National Planning Commission. These embody the pulse of women in this country and present the NPC with a dynamic opportunity to engage with in ongoing discourse with the aspirations of South African women. Even more importantly this engagement should enable these opinions and experiences to shape and influence policy making and planning across the nine identified priority areas.

The inputs of women were primarily concerned with the key areas of:

### Education

- Safe, registered, well-equipped, community based, and community run, state subsidised child care
  centers need to be introduced to consolidate the child care requirements of working/studying
  parents.
- ECD should take into account issues as diverse as children with disabilities, parents who do shift
  work, language competency for school readiness and the need for vigorous parent & teacher
  participation in shaping governance.
- On-going training and reskilling of preschool, primary, secondary teachers and other educators is a critical response to the dearth of skilled educators
- Community based parent/educator forums should be formed to collectively address issues such as teenage pregnancy, moral regeneration, improvement of school facilities, and promotion of mother-tongue African languages as medium of instruction
- To facilitate ongoing partnerships with Sector Education and Training Authorities, Education
   Training and Development Practitioners SETA, Further Education and Training colleges, and
   Institutes of Higher Learning
- The state needs to consider the allocation of funds to township and rural schools, for improving
  yards and amenities and to enable African language teaching /learning so that these schools
  produce the same quality as Model Cs.

## **Employment**

- Business planning ,funding , mentoring and long term support for women, particularly given the differential access to education;
- Issues of discrimination whether through age, disability or educational status were raised which also bring into focus the need to align best labour practice with women's particular social situations;

- Gender preferential tender processes and accompanying training programmes and institutional support at municipalities by for example placing women's companies on a database are suggested to facilitate women's economic participation;
- The suggestion of grants for women to purchase basic necessities but also to develop a culture of saving. Research illustrates that the children and households of women with access to grants experience improved wellbeing, educational attainment and nutrition.

#### Infrastructure

- Government needs to deal with the poor road and social infrastructure more swiftly and facilitate community based planning with women at the centre of the discourse;
- That land acquisition and management are feminist issues and that women need to access land
  acquisition rights for farming, property development and livelihood. The women stated that this
  access needs to be independent of men/spouses/fathers etc.
- Environmental health and resource management pertaining to lakes, rivers, rubbish tips and
  pollution has been identified as key to women's development and wellbeing. This is also linked
  to time use surveys which illustrate the use of women's time spent in water and fuel collection
  and purification.
- Linked to this, optimal spatial planning needs to take into account lighting, distance and means of transportation for women as they move between places of residence, work, ablutions, social amenities, schools, and childcare centres. The transit distances between destinations are often where women and girl children are vulnerable to rape, sexual abuse, mugging and even murder. This extends to the assault of girls on school grounds where toilets are often far from classrooms making female students and even teachers vulnerable.
- It was also suggested that women's businesses be housed in disused municipal buildings with support and the possibility of burden sharing as the businesses grow
- Form co-operatives to address and understand the green economy and possibly use SAWID as an anchor for a Green Summit.

#### **Resource Intensive Growth**

• The women recognise that skills transfer and intergenerational knowledge transfer from elders to younger people is critical to cohesion, knowledge and memory.

## **Spatial Inequality**

- The narratives of women repeated the demand for rationalised spatial planning and development in relation to schools, clinics, transport and social amenities;
- Participatory development on spatial planning was suggested in order to enable African communities to enjoy the benefits of well-being experienced in White communities including parks, schools, recreation areas, libraries etc. to improve life chances;
- An important note was that development should be conceptualized before settlement rather than the haphazard piecemeal approach;
- A mixed approach to spatial planning was strongly suggested and this links very strongly to the recommendations on Infrastructural Development .

## **Health Systems And Spatial Growth**

- Women in rural areas are not taken into consideration or consulted regarding health policies. There is a need for consultation with women in rural areas and for the issue of cultural myths to be taken into consideration.
- People find it difficult to go and test in clinics near their areas because of lack of confidentiality from the local nurses so alternative health care facilities are also necessary.
- It is necessary to put in place proper monitoring and evaluation of people testing positive for
- HIV/AIDS because some of them don't come back for treatment after testing.
- Mobile clinics and health facilities for women in rural areas and informal settlements will avoid
  the need to walk long distances for assistance. In addition old farmhouses in rural areas could be
  converted for community healthcare.
- The need for community forums of women (Takaneng)comprised of elders to advise younger women on self-esteem, negotiating safe sex, appropriate contraception, how to make selfdetermined choices about sex
- It is critical to embark on community programmes of wellbeing, to encourage healthy eating, participation in sports for young people and children in particular. In addition campaigns against drug and alcohol abuse must be introduced and championed by NGOs and Government with community and parental support
- Retired nurses should be recalled to assist with the workload in public hospitals
- Traditional forms of health care and homebirths must be supported by and complementary to the conventional State health care systems.

- HIV/AIDS treatment should also integrate alternative, natural remedies to enable people to have choices and to encourage healthy lifestyles such as a nutritional diet as complementary to HIV/AIDS treatment
- Women and girls need forums to explain safe sex, the use of the pill and the use of condoms and the understanding that the pill does not protect against HIV.
- Schools, parents, the community, the State, peer training, traditional guidance forums and the media have a mutually supporting role to play in raising health issues, providing safe sex education, facilitating the distribution of menstrual pads, assisting in lowering infant mortality, and ensuring overall wellbeing awareness.

#### **Public Service Performance**

- Social Auxiliary Workers (SAWs) are providing immense support to government to perform better by referring the families under their care to Government departments such as Home Affairs for birth certificate and ID's
- Social Auxiliary workers are also assisting the Department of Housing by helping women to register for RDP houses
- The SAWs support the Department of Social Development by supporting women in registering for various grants and required state support
- SAWs support various Health institutions by supporting communities living with HIV/AIDS treatment, diabetics, and persons with mental health challenges
- SAWs support the Department of Labour by referring people to learnerships. In this way SAW's are supporting government to render services to communities
- The Department of Public Services Administration should support the Development Caravan since it focuses on the enhancement of Government services to its citizens whilst ensuring that the scourge of poverty is eradicated.
- Participatory partnerships between grassroots community groups, municipalities and the state are necessary to ensure accountability and optimal planning

#### Corruption

- Women across this country are unhappy with levels of corruption and suggest 'naming and shaming officials' who are corrupt in the Public or Private sectors.
- Women suggested the use of the corruption Hotline to report corruption
- The Public Service sector should support the Development Caravan since it focuses on the enhancement of Government services to its citizens whilst ensuring that poverty eradication gets done, family by family.

### **Divided Society**

- We need to have more and more dialogues and talk and vent out how we feel.
- Dialogues will assist to build better and united communities

## XXI. Recommendations

### **Addressing Causes Of Poverty**

The National Planning Commission can use best practice approaches to inculcate a transformative, gender aligned agenda.

- A thorough analysis of underlying causes of poverty and social injustice at multiple levels with multiple stakeholders. The analysis must be gendered and sex disaggregated data at all indicator levels should be collected, synthesized and analyzed on an ongoing basis, according to learning and accountability needs. Thorough analysis means applying gender and cultural analysis.
- A clearly defined goal for impact on the lives of a specific group, realized at a broad scale. The goal
  should be developed in consultation with most impacted groups, such as women's groups, and
  unemployed communities. Expected change towards gender equality should be clearly defined by
  the project and programme objectives with finite time and task lines.
- Women's movements must feel capable of engaging with all elements of the present policy discourse, either to recommend improvements, or to produce critiques, in particular of the macroeconomic aspects.
- Of particular interest is the poverty eradication model introduced in Chile and successfully replicated in Colombia. Having enhanced the Chilean model, Colombia has successfully lifted 1.5 million people from extreme poverty in seven years. The Chilean and Tunisian models have both been studied by SAWID over the past 6 years. Chile also emerged from a period of profound social disrepair and inequality and in twenty five years shifted poverty statistics from 45% in 1990 to 18 % in 2004.(Report on Study Tour and Chile and Tunisia).

#### **Consultation And Interactive Learning**

 Organise expert group meetings, ad hoc working groups in specific areas, and broad-based consultations with civil society groups, trade justice activists, parliamentarians and women's organisation on gender, poverty and trade

- Ongoing processes to solicit inputs from sector and stakeholder groups notably gender based / women's formations from academia, grass roots groups, labour, informal traders among others
- Embed a deliberate process of analysis, reflection & learning about staff competencies & attitudes
   related to gender programming within government and implementing institutions
- Include a deliberate process of analysis, reflection, learning about gender norms involving women
   & men across relevant government and implementing institutions

### **Early Childhood Development**

Studies and real field experience working in this area proves that a child's aptitude to grow and live up to his or her full potential is directly connected to the availability of sufficient nutrition, mental stimulation, interaction with others, the well-being of the mother or primary caretaker and living environment. Early interventions result in tangible and measurable returns as a preventive measure compared with costly remedial services later in life that poor countries cannot afford to provide. The first few years of life are critical to children's survival and growth, especially children born to HIV positive mothers. To work, ECD programs must be interrelated to address other core areas including food security. This is critical to ensure the health of young children and their families. Medium-term results include the following:

- Early childhood services must aim to improve rates of timely enrolment in primary school, so that children are better prepared for success in school leading to better attendance records, fewer repeat grades, lower drop out of school less, and higher primary education completion.
- Parent education and child development services combined with good case management and tracking systems improve child rearing, reduce child abuse, and reduce child welfare costs. (Vargas-Barón & Williams 2008)

These savings often more than compensate for expanding investment in early childhood. And, over the long term, they yield additional savings related to improved national productivity, increased taxes, reduced criminality, and enhanced citizen engagement (Vargas-Barón & Williams 2008).

## **Supporting Women's Economic Empowerment To End Poverty**

- Support research and development programmes to provide technological solutions for diversification in order to address issues of increased competition facing small-scale women producers and SMEs.
- Build capacity to address micro-meso-macro linkages effectively
- Support the development of programmes to minimise risk and vulnerability, especially in terms
  of social protection and insurance

- Support entitlements as well as capabilities programmes and projects
- Promote clustering and networking among groups of women producers and workers
- Support independent research on gender and trade policy issues, including on the gendered impacts of trade liberalisation on the services sector and other sectors of interest to women
- Assist in the identification and revision of laws and commercial regulations to improve women's rights to ownership and use of economic assets
- Organise national multi-stakeholder consultations on key issues in gender and trade (e.g.
  impacts of trade policies on the informal sector, women's rights in the areas of food security,
  access to essential services, employment, domestic labour laws, fiscal revenue and taxation)
- a gendered employment strategy. Such a strategy would address women's disadvantaged labour
  market position and the obstacles faced by low-income mothers who want to move into paid
  work, while being sensitive to the wishes of mothers on benefit who prioritise their children's
  care over paid employment; aculture that exacerbates the impact of poverty on both children
  and their parents/mothers;

### **Infrastructure and Spatial Planning**

- Consulting women on the choice of acceptable and affordable technologies including easy access to internet facilities ,banking and ICT portals
- Giving womenspace and priority in the design and location of living, working, social, transport
  and leisure facilities. Inadequate and gender blind infrastructure planning can cost women time,
  safety, income and even their lives.
- Time use analyses outlining women's time spent travelling between various life spaces (work to home, home to transport, transport to shops, home to water/fuel collection, time spent caring for children/elderly/the sick) will assist the NPC in aligning the nine programme areas to an anchor on infrastructure planning including provision of housing, healthcare, schools, roads etc
  - Involving women in construction and financing of facilities because the expertise and needs of women in these areas differs and conditions differ for married women and female household heads
  - Ensuring that women receive technical training, regarding best practice management of community amenities and infrastructure
  - Involving women in health education, as sanitation projects will not succeed without their support and behavioural change

- More recognition is needed of the diverse organisational forms, often highly
  informal, involved in infrastructure services provision and management in poor
  communities, and theways in which gender, and other social divisions (e.g.
  caste, class), are represented in these.
- Gender analysis could be brought to bear on those subsectors which have thus far received little attention in infrastructure development, e.g. telecommunications, with particular attention to questions of access, activity patterns and time use and potential income-generating effects in low income households.

### **XXII Conclusion**

If classic conceptualisations of the 'feminisation of poverty' are methodologically and analytically inappropriate in depicting trends in gendered deprivation, this arguably leaves us with two choices. One is that existing terminology is abandoned, and perhaps substituted by something akin to a 'feminisation of responsibility and/or obligation'. The second is that the term is retained with the proviso that the poverty part of the construct refers not just to income but other, albeit related, deprivations.

The latter is conceivably preferable: first, because the 'feminisation of poverty' is succinct, well-known, and has already gone some way to 'en-gender' poverty reduction strategies, and second because giving poverty a more explicit multidimensional emphasis would bring it more in line with poverty discourses in general. Provided it is made patently clear that poverty is not just about incomes, but inputs, the 'feminisation of poverty' would have greater theoretical empirical resonance.

It would also provide a better basis for policy interventions which in the process of directing poverty reduction programmes to, and or through, women, can simply add to the disproportionate burdens they are currently carrying.

Such approaches can be complemented by programmes to transform masculinist norms and behaviours in relation to care work and responsibilities. Schools, public education, child and adolescent programme should focus gender education not only on girls but also on boys and young men. Consistent attention has to be paid to violence against women and girls within households which is often triggered by women's not meeting male demands in relation to food, keeping the house clean, taking care of

children, sexuality or reproduction. Such changes in anti-poverty programmes may require as a pre- or at least a co-requisite, the transformation of mindsets within government bureaucracies towards greater awareness of the gendered consequences of policies and programmes.

The disadvantaged position in any given society is based on the relations of class, race and gender-based access to social resources and opportunities defining as well women's unequal access to resources and opportunities. The mandate of the National Planning Commission is to diagnose these inequalities and provide a platform for multi pronged, multi stakeholder responses.

These include: developing public services for the hard to reach; promoting individual and collective assets; expanding social protection; strengthening measures for anti-discrimination and women's empowerment; and addressing infrastructure and strategic urbanisation. However, as this paper has highlighted, it is critical to pay more in-depth attention to gender dynamics if these policy approaches are to reach the indigent and most vulnerable. Approaches that overlook the multidimensionality of gendered and generational experiences of chronic poverty and vulnerability are more likely to flounder and to fail to support girls and young women in new pathways to empowerment. Moreover, families and wider communities are likely to miss out on the potential multiplier effects of investing in girls and achieving development goals more broadly.

## **XXIII References**

Ahl, H. (2006). Why Research on Women Entrepreneurs Needs New Directions. Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice, 595•]621.

Ahmed, S., & Holtz, S. (2007). Social and Economic Consequences of Obstetric and Fistula: Life Changed Forever? International Journal of Gynecology aObstetrics, 99, S10•]S15.

Akiyode, O. O. (2010). Gender Mainstreaming of Environmental Concerns: Panacea for Environmental Sustainability and Peace in the Niger Delta Region. Journal of Sustainable Development in Africa, 12 (2), 301•]314.

Bayes, A. (1998, Winter). NGO•]Promoted Microcredit Programmes and Women's Empowerment in Rural Bangladesh: s,Quantitative and Qualitative Evidence. Journal of Developing Area221•]236.

Amin, S., & Al•]Bassusi, N. (2004). Education, Wage Work and Marriage: I of Marriage and Perspectives of Egyptian Working Women. JournaFamily, 66, 1287•]1299.

Amponsah, F., Turner, J., Grieco, M., & Guitink, P. (1996). Commercial Use of Non Motorized Transport: Evidence from Accra, Ghana. Retrieved from Transport Links "Transport for Development": http://www.transport•]links.org/transport\_links/filearea/publications/1\_646\_PA3165

Anderson, L. M. (2003). The Effectiveness of Early Childhood Programmes. American Journal of PrevenAttanasio, O., & Vera•]Hernandez, M. (2004). Medium and LongTerm Effects of unity Nursery Programmeof Development Policies. Nutrition and Childcare: Evaluation of a Commin Rural Colombia. Centre for the Evaluation oBalducci, E., Clements, B., Gupta, S., & Cui, Q. (2004). Social Spending, Human Capital and Growth in Developing Countries: Implications for Achieving eved from International Monetary the MDGs. Retrind: http://cdi.mecon.gov.ar/biblio/docelec/fmi/wp/wp04217.pdf Balmori, H. (2003). Gender and Budgets: Overview Report. Retrieved from /0708/DOC19156.pd

http://www.eldis.org/vfile/upload/1/documentf Barcellos, S. H., Carvalho, L., & Lleras•]Muney, A. (2010). Child Gender and Parental Investments in India. Retrieved from RAND Corporation: d

59 http://www.rand.org/pubs/working\_papers/2010/RAND\_WR756.pf Bardasi, E., Blackden, M., & Guzman, J. C. (2007). Gender, Entrepreneurship, and Competitiveness in Africa. In Africa Competitiveness Report 2007 (pp. 69•]85). Washington DC: World Bank.

CARE Österreich's approach to Gender & Women's Empowerment (July 2009)

- Esteve-Volart, B. (2004). Gender Discrimination and Growth: Theory and Evidence from India.

  London: DEDPS Working Paper No. 42, London School of Economics and Political Science.
  Feder, G., & Feeny, D. (1991). Land Tenure and Property Rights: Theory and ment Policy.

  World Bank Economic Review, 5 Implications for Develop(1), 135-153. Floro, M., & Seguino,
  S. (2002). Gender Effects on Aggregate Savings: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis.

  Retrieved from Policy Research ttp://mpra.ub.uni-
- Paper on Gender and Development: hmuenchen.de/11271/1/MPRA\_paper\_11271.pdf Food and Agriculture Organisation. (2003). *GenderSensitive Indicators for Natural Resources Management*. Retrieved from FAO: ftp://ftp.fao.org/docrep/fao/010/a0521e/a0521e00.pdf Galor, O., & Weil, D. N. (1996). The Gender Gap, Fertility, and Growth. *American Economic Review*,
- Galor, O., & Weil, D. N. (1996). The Gender Gap, Fertility, and Growth. American Economic Review, 86 (3), 374-387. ). Land Reforms and Economic ynamics, 14, 527–547.
- Gersbach, H., & Siemers, L.-H. R. (2010Development. *Macroeconomic D*Goldberg, P. K., & Paveenik, N. (2004). *Trade, Inequality, and Poverty: What Do We Know? Evidence from Recent Trade Liberalization Episodes in Developing Countries*. Retrieved from National Bureau of Economic Research: http://www.nber.org/papers/w10593 Gregson, S., Waddell, H., & Chandiwana, S. (2001). School Education and HIV journal of Control in Sub-Saharan Africa: From Discord to Harmony? *JouInternational Development*, 13, 467-485. Grown, C., Gupta, G. R., & Pande, R. (2005). Taking Action to Improve r Equality and Women's Women's Health Through GendeEmpowerment. *The Lancet*, 365 (9458), 541-543.

Andía-Pérez, B. and A. Beltrán-Barco. 2002. Analysis of the Public Budget with a Gender Approach: Villa El Salvador. UNIFEM-Andean Region, Lima.

Anttonen, Anneli. 2005. "Empowering social policy: The role of the social care services in modern welfare states." In O. Kangas and J. Palme (eds.), Social Policy and Economic Development in the Nordic Countries. UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Anttonen, Anneli, Jet Bussemaker, Ute Gerhard, Jacqueline Heinen, Stina Johansson, Brita Siim, Arnlaug Leira, Ruth Lister, Constanza Tobio, Fiona Williams, with Anna Gavanas. Forthcoming.

Gendering Citizenship in Western Europe: New Challenges for Citizenship Research in a Cross-National Context. Polity Press, Cambridge.

Anttonen, Anneli and Jorma Sipliä. 1996. "European social care services: Is it possible to identify models?" Journal of European Social Policy, Vol. 6, No. 2, pp. 87–100.

Baumol, William J. and W.G. Bowen. 1965. "On the performing arts: The anatomy of their economic problems." American Economic Review, Vol. 50, No. 2, pp. 495–502.

Blondet, Cecilia. 2002. "The 'devil's deal': Women's political participation and authoritarianism in Peru." In Maxine Molyneux and Shahra Razavi (eds.), Gender Justice, Development and Rights. Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Boserup, Ester. 1970. Women's Role in Economic Development. St. Martin's Press, London.

Budlender, Debbie. 2007. A Critical Review of Selected Time Use Surveys. Programme on Gender and

Development, Paper No. 2. UNRISD, Geneva.

———. 2004. The Cost of Home-Based Care. UNIFEM Southern African Regional Office, Harare, Zimbabwe.

Cagatay, Nilufer, Diane Elson and Caren Grown. 1995. "Introduction." World Development, Vol. 23, No. 11, pp. 1827–1836.

Cagatay, Nilufer and Süle Ozler. 1995. "Feminization of the labour force: The effects of long-term development and structural adjustment." World Development, Vol. 23, No. 11, pp. 1883–1894. Daly, Mary. 2001. "Care policies in Western Europe." In M. Daly (ed.), Care Work: The Quest for Security. International Labour Organization, Geneva.

Dobrowolsky, Alexandra and Jane Jenson. 2004. "Shifting representation of citizenship: Canadian politics of 'women' and 'children'." Social Politics, Vol. 11, No. 2, pp. 154–180.

Donath, Susan. 2000. "The other economy: A suggestion for a distinctively feminist economics." Feminist Economics, Vol. 6, No. 1, pp. 115–123.

Edholm, Felicity, Olivia Harris and Kate Young. 1977. "Conceptualising women." Critique of Anthropology, Vol. 9/10, No. 3, pp. 101–130.

Ehrenreich, Barbara and Arlie Russell Hochchild (eds.). 2002. Global Women: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy. Holt, New York.

Elson, Diane. 2005. Unpaid Work, the Millennium Development Goals, and Capital Accumulation. Paper presented at the conference on Unpaid Work and the Economy: Gender, Poverty and the Millennium Development Goals, United Nations Development Programme and Levy Economics Institute of Bard College, Annandale-on-Hudson, New York, 1–3 October.

———. 2004. "Social policy and macroeconomic performance: Integrating 'the economic' and 'the social'." In Thandika Mkandawire (ed.), Social Policy in a Development Context. UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

——. 1995. "Gender awareness in modelling structural adjustment." World Development, Vol. 23, No. 11, pp. 1851–1868.

Elson, Diane (ed.). 1991. Male Bias in the Development Process. Manchester University Press, Manchester.

Esping-Andersen, Gosta. 1999. Social Foundations of Post Industrial Economies. Oxford University Press, Oxford.

——. 1990. The Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism. Princeton University Press, Princeton. Etzioni, Amitai. 1993. The Spirit of Community. HarperCollins, London.

Fine, Ben. 2004. "Social policy and development: Social capital as point of departure." In Thandika Mkandawire (ed.), Social Policy in a Development Context. UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Fisher, Berenice and Joan Tronto. 1990. "Toward a feminist theory of caring." In Emily Abel and Margaret Nelson (eds.), Circles of Care: Work and Identity in Women's Lives. State University of New York Press, Albany.

Folbre, Nancy. 2006a. "Demanding quality: Worker/consumer coalitions and 'high road' strategies in the care sector." Politics and Society, Vol. 34, No. 1, pp. 11–31.

———. 2006b. "Measuring care: Gender, empowerment, and the care economy." Journal of Human Development, Vol. 7, No. 2, pp. 183–199.

———. 2001. The Invisible Heart: Economics and Family Values. New Press, New York.

———. 1994. Who Pays for the Kids? Gender and the Structures of Constraint. Routledge, London.

Folbre, Nancy and Julie A. Nelson. 2000. "For love or money—or both?" Journal of Economic Perspectives, Vol. 14, No. 4, pp. 123–140.

Fraser, Nancy. 1997. "After the family wage: A postindustrial thought experiment." In Nancy Fraser (ed.), Justice Interruptus: Critical Reflections of the "PostSocialist" Condition. Routledge, London.

Fraser, Nancy and Linda Gordon. 1994. "A genealogy of dependency: Tracing a keyword of the U.S. welfare state." Signs, Vol. 19, No. 2, pp. 309–336.

Giddens, Anthony. 1998. The Third Way: The Renewal of Social Democracy. Polity Press, Cambridge. Gilligan, Carol. 1982. In a Different Voice. Harvard University Press, Cambridge.

Giullari, Susi and Jane Lewis. 2005. The Adult Worker Model Family, Gender Equality and Care: The Search for New Policy Principles, and the Possibilities and Problems of a Capabilities Approach.

Programme on Social Policy and Development, Paper No. 19. UNRISD, Geneva.

Gonzalez de la Rocha, Mercedes. 1994. The Resources of Poverty. Blackwell, Oxford.

Haney, Lynne. 2002. Inventing the Needy: Gender and The Politics of Welfare in Hungary. University of California Press, Berkeley.

Haney, Lynne and Lisa Pollard. 2003. "In a family way: Theorizing state and familial relations." In L. Haney and L. Pollard (eds.), Families of a New World: Gender, Politics, and State Development in a Global Context. Routledge, New York.

Harrison, J. 1973. "The political economy of housework." Bulletin of the Conference of Socialist Economists, Winter, pp. 35–52.

Hassim, Shireen. 2006. "Gender equality and developmental social welfare in South Africa." In S. Razavi and S. Hassim (eds.), Gender and Social Policy in a Global Context: Uncovering the Gendered Structure of "the Social". UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Hassim, Shireen and Shahra Razavi. 2006. "Gender and social policy in a global context: Uncovering the gendered structure of 'the social'." In S. Razavi and S. Hassim (eds.), Gender and Social Policy in a Global Context: Uncovering the Gendered Structure of "the Social". UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Hewitt de Alcántara, Cynthia. 1993. "Introduction: Markets in principle and practice". In Cynthia Hewitt de Alcántara (ed.), Real Markets: Social and Political Issues of Food Policy Reform. Frank Cass in association with the European Association of Development Research and Training Institutes, Bonn and UNRISD, Geneva.

Himmelweit, Susan. 2005. Can We Afford (Not) to Care: Prospects and Policy. GeNet Working Paper No.11. Gender Equality Network, Economic and Social Research Council, Cambridge.

Himmelweit, Susan (ed.). 2000. Inside the Household: From Labour to Care. Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Hirway, Indira. 2005. Integrating Unpaid Work into Development Policy. Paper presented at the conference Unpaid Work and the Economy: Gender, Poverty and the Millennium Development Goals, United Nations and Levy Economics Institute of Bard College, Annandale-on-Hudson, New York, 1–3 October.

Hobson, B. 1990. "No exit no voice: Women's economic dependency and the welfare state." Acta Sociologica, Vol. 33, pp. 235–250.

Hochschild, Arlie R. 2000. "Global care chains and emotional surplus value." In W. Hutton and A. Giddens (eds.), On the Edge: Living with Global Capitalism. Jonathan Cape, London. Huber, Evelyne and John D. Stephens. 2000. "Partisan governance, women's employment, and the social democratic service state." American Sociological Review, Vol. 65, No. 3, pp. 323–342. Jelin, Elizabeth. 1990. "Introduction." In E. Jelin (ed.), Women and Social Change in Latin America. Jenson, Jane. 1997. "Who cares? Gender and welfare regimes." Social Politics, Vol. 4, No. 2, pp. 182–187.

Jenson, Jane and Denis Saint-Martin. 2003. "New routes to social cohesion? Citizenship and the social investment state." Canadian Journal of Sociology, Vol. 28, No. 1, pp. 77–99.

———. 2002. Building Blocks for a New Welfare Architecture: From Ford to LEGO. Paper prepared for the Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, Boston,

29 August–1 September.

Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Kabeer, Naila. 1994. Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought. Verso, London. Kittay, Eva Feder with Bruce Jennings and Angela A. Wasunna. 2005. "Dependence, difference and the global ethic of long-term care." The Journal of Political Philosophy, Vol. 13, No. 4, pp. 443–469. Knijn, Trudie and Monique Kremer. 1997. "Gender and the caring dimension of welfare states: Toward inclusive citizenship." Social Politics, Vol. 4, No. 1, pp. 328–361.

Koven, Seth and Sonya Michel. 1993. "Introduction: Motherworlds." In Seth Koven and Sonya Michel (eds.), Mothers of a New World: Maternalist Politics and the Origins of Welfare States.

Routledge, New York.

Kwon, Huck-Ju. 2005. "An overview of the study: The developmental welfare state and policy reformsin East Asia." In Huck-Ju Kwon (ed.), Transforming the Developmental Welfare State in East Asia. UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Leira, Arnlaug. 1993. "The 'woman-friendly' welfare state?: The case of Norway and Sweden." In Jane Lewis (ed.), Women and Social Policies in Europe. Edward Elgar, Aldershot.

Lewis, Jane. 2001. "The decline of the male breadwinner model: The implications for work and care." Social Politics, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 152–170.

———. 1997. "Gender and welfare regimes: Further thoughts." Social Politics, Vol. 4, No. 1, pp. 160–177.

———. 1992. "Gender and the development of welfare regimes." Journal of European Social Policy, Vol. 2, No. 3, pp. 159–173.

Lister, Ruth. 1997. Citizenship: Feminist Perspectives. Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Mackintosh, M. and M. Koivusalo. 2005. "Health systems and commercialization: In search of good sense." In M. Mackintosh and M. Koivusalo (eds.), Commercialization of Health Care: Global and Local Dynamics and Policy Responses. UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Mackintosh, M. and P. Tibandebage. 2006. "Gender and health sector reform: Analytical perspectives on

African experience." In S. Razavi and S. Hassim (eds.), Gender and Social Policy in a Global Context: Uncovering the Gendered Structure of "the Social". UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave

Madoerin, Mascha. 2006. The Political and Social Economy of Care in Switzerland: Some Research Ideas and Questions. UNRISD, Geneva. Mimeo.

Meagher, Gabrielle. 2006. "What can we expect from paid carers?" Politics and Society, Vol. 34, No. 1, pp. 33–53.

Mensah, Kwadwo. 2005. "International migration of health care staff: Extent and policy responses, with illustrations from Ghana." In M. Mackintosh and M. Koivusalo (eds.), Commercialization of Health Care: Global and Local Dynamics and Policy Responses. UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Moghadam, Valentine. 2006. "Maternalist policies versus women's economic citizenship? Gendered social policy in Iran". In S. Razavi and S. Hassim (eds.), Gender and Social Policy in a Global Context: Uncovering the Gendered Structure of "the Social". UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Moletsane, Reddy, Ntombela et al. 2010. Gender and Poverty Reduction: Voice, Dialogue and Targeting. Human Science and Research Council.

Molyneux, Maxine. 2007. Change and Continuity in Social Protection in Latin America: Mothers at the Service of the State? Programme on Gender and Development, Paper No. 1. UNRISD, Geneva.

———. 2006. "Mothers at the service of the New Poverty Agenda: Progresa/Oportunidades, Mexico's conditional transfer programme." Social Policy and Administration, Vol. 40, No. 4, pp. 425–449.

———. 1979. "Beyond the domestic labour debate." New Left Review, Vol. I, No. 116.

Myles, John and Jill Quadagno. 2000. "Envisioning a Third Way: The welfare state in the twenty-first century." Contemporary Sociology, Vol. 29, No. 1, pp. 156–167.

Nakano Glenn, Evelyn. 1992. "From servitude to service work: Historical continuities in the racial division of paid reproductive labor." Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society, Vol. 18, No. 1, pp. 1–43.

The political and social economy of care in a development context:conceptual issues, research questions and policy options ,Shahra Razavi

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). 2001. OECD Employment Outlook. OECD, Paris.

Orloff, Ann Shola. 2006. "From maternalism to 'employment for all': State policies to improve women's employment across the affluent democracies." In Jonah Levy (ed.), The State after Statism.

Harvard University Press, Cambridge.

———. 2002. Women's Employment and Welfare Regimes: Globalization, Export-Orientation and Social Policy in Europe and North America. Programme on Social Policy and Development, Paper No. 12. UNRISD, Geneva.

——. 1993. "Gender and the social rights of citizenship: The comparative analysis of gender relations and welfare states." American Sociological Review, Vol. 58, pp. 303–328.

Palmer, Ingrid. 1991. Gender and Population in the Adjustment of African Economies: Planning for Change. Women, Work and Development Series No. 19, International Labour Organization, Geneva.

Parrenas, Rhacel Salazar. 2005. Children of Global Migration: Transnational Families and Gender Woes. Stanford University Press, Palo Alto, CA.

———. 2001. Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration and Domestic Work. Stanford University Press, Palo Alto, CA.

Pearl R. 2002. "The Andean Region: A multi-country programme." In D. Budlender and G. Hewitt (eds.), Gender Budgets Make More Cents: Country Studies and Good Practice. Commonwealth Secretariat, London.

Pearson, Ruth, Ann Whitehead and Kate Young. 1981. "Introduction: The continuing subordination of women in the development process." In Kate Young, Carol Wolkowitz and Roslyn McCullagh (eds.), Of Marriage and the Market: Women's Subordination Internationally and its Lessons. Routledge, London.

Peng, Ito. 2006. "Social policy reforms and gender in Japan and South Korea." In S. Razavi and S. Hassim (eds.), Gender and Social Policy in a Global Context: Uncovering the Gendered Structure of "the Social". UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Phillips, Anne. 2006. "'Really' equal: Opportunities and autonomy." The Journal of Political Philosophy, Vol. 14, No. 1, pp. 18–32.

Razavi, Shahra. 2007. "The return to social policy and the persistent neglect of unpaid care." Development and Change, Vol. 38, No. 3, pp. 377–400.

———. 2006. "'Islamic politics, human rights and women's claims for equality in Iran." Third World Quarterly, Vol. 27, No. 7, pp. 1223–1237.

Razavi, Shahra and Carol Miller. 1995. From WID to GAD: Conceptual Shifts in the Women and Development Discourse. Occasional Paper Series for Beijing, No. 1. UNRISD, Geneva.

Rubery, Jill, Mark Smith, Dominique Anxo and Lennart Flood. 2001. "The future European labor supply: The critical role of the family." Feminist Economics, Vol. 7, No. 3, pp. 33–69.

Sainsbury, Diane. 2001. "Gender and the making of welfare states: Norway and Sweden." Social Politics, Vol. 8, pp. 113–143.

———. 1994. "Women's and men's social rights: Gendering dimensions of welfare states." In Diane Sainsbury (ed.), Gendering Welfare States. Sage Publications, London.

Sorj, Bila. 2001. "Child care as public policy in Brazil." In M. Daly (ed.), Care Work: The Quest for

Security. International Labour Organization, Geneva.

Standing, Guy. 1999. Global Labour Flexibility: Seeking Distributive Justice. Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Steinhilber, Silke. 2006. "Gender and post-socialist welfare states in Central and Eastern Europe: Family policy reforms in Poland and the Czech Republic Compared." In S. Razavi and S. Hassim (eds.), Gender and Social Policy in a Global Context: Uncovering the Gendered Structure of "the

Social". UNRISD, Geneva and Palgrave Macmillan, Basingstoke.

Tronto, Joan C. 1993. Moral Boundaries: A Political Argument for an Ethic of Care. Routledge, New York.

Twigg, Julia. 2000. Bathing: The Body and Community Care. Routledge, London.

United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD). 2005. Gender Equality: Striving for Justice in an Unequal World. UNRISD, Geneva.

Urdang, Stephanie. 2006. "The care economy: Gender and the silent AIDS crisis in Southern Africa." Journal of Southern African Studies, Vol. 32, No. 1, pp. 165–177.

UNRISD PROGRAMME ON GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT

PAPER NUMBER 3

Williams, Fiona. 2001. "In and beyond New Labour: Towards a new political ethics of care." Critical Social Policy, Vol. 21, No. 4, pp. 467–493.

World Bank. 2005. World Development Report 2006: Equity and Development. Oxford University Press, New York.

Yeates, Nicola. 2004. "Global care chains: Critical reflections and lines of enquiry." International Feminist Journal of Politics, Vol. 6, No. 3, pp. 369–391.